

**MINUTES
STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
NOVEMBER 14, 2008**

The State Board of Education met for its regular meeting in the First Floor Conference Room of the Andrew Johnson Tower, Nashville, Tennessee, at 8:30 a.m., CST, on November 14, 2008.

Present..... 10 Absent.....1

Mr. Fielding Rolston, Chair
Mr. Flavius Barker
Ms. Vernita Justice
Ms. Carolyn Pearre
Mr. Richard Ray
Dr. Jean Anne Rogers
Ms. Teresa Sloyan
Dr. Melvin Wright
Dr. Richard Rhoda, Ex-Officio
Ms. Brittni England

Mr. Jim Ayers

Chairman Rolston called the meeting to order and welcomed members of the audience.

Chairman Rolston then presented service awards to Board employees, **Ms. Phyllis Childress**, Executive Assistant, for 35 years of state service and **Mr. Rich Haglund**, Legal Counsel, for 5 years of state service. **Chairman Rolston** and **Dr. Gary Nixon**, Executive Director congratulated both employees and thanked them for their service.

Chairman Rolston indicated that changes were being made to the agenda by removing Item III.C.--Additional Endorsement Areas, Rule and Item IV.A.--Leadership-Tennessee Learning Centered Leadership System Policy. Item III.D.-Teacher Education Unit Programs/Licensure Areas was moved to Final Reading.

I. Consent Items

- A. *Adoption of Agenda***
- B. *Approval of Minutes from August 22, 2008***

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved acceptance. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

II. Report Items

- A. *Report Card on the Effectiveness of Teacher Training Programs***

Mr. Art Fuller, State Board of Education, provided an overview of the Teacher Quality Report Card emphasizing the main points outlined on pages 5 through 6 of the report.

Mr. Fuller noted that the Teacher Quality Report resulted from the BEP 2.0 accountability bill passed during the past legislative session.

Mr. Fuller reviewed the following major areas of the report:

1. Placement & Retention

- Statewide 94% of teachers are placed in their first year of eligibility
- Statewide 99.5% of teachers are placed by their third year of eligibility

2. Teacher Effect

- The State Board received assistance from the Governor's Office of State Planning and Policy.
- The goals of the study were to identify highly effective teachers and highly ineffective teachers in comparison to a statewide distribution group.
- On page 46 of the report, there were a number of institutions with positively significant scores in comparison to either the entire statewide distribution of teachers or the more specific subgroup of teachers with comparable years of experience.

Mr. Ray asked what **Mr. Fuller's** overall rating of the teacher quality report card would be if he were education czar.

Mr. Fuller replied that this should be looked at as the first year and baseline for the report card, noting that in many cases this is the first year in which institutions of higher education have access to this type of data.

Mr. Ray noted that **Mr. Fuller** had not answered his question.

Mr. Fuller replied that it was a mixed bag that was skewed slightly positive because of the noted positively significant occurrences in the areas of Reading/Language Arts. However, in looking at other areas like Mathematics, there was not a similar occurrence of statistically significant positive indicators.

Chairman Rolston asked if there had been a correlation between the teacher effect data outcomes and the Department of Education's evaluation of accrediting teacher training programs.

Mr. Martin Nash, Department of Education, noted that such type of analysis had not occurred and reiterated the value of the State's focus on improving reading scores.

Mr. Ray referred to the Board's discussion on the previous day in regards to establishing specific letter grades for the report cards and asked **Mr. Fuller** what would be his recommendation.

Mr. Fuller stated that if grades were to be assigned it would be best for a third party to design a rigorous set of parameters upon which to sufficiently determine grades.

Dr. Gary Nixon, Executive Director, State Board of Education, also noted the presence of additional factors beyond teacher training programs which have an impact on teacher effect. He further stated that it would also be important to consider these types of factors.

3. Praxis Scores

- **Mr. Fuller** addressed the issue of Federal Title II Praxis scores and the issue of "program completers", noting that institutions have the flexibility to come up with different definitions related to the term.
- **Mr. Fuller** noted there was a discrepancy on the issue of "program completers" as a factor towards the relatively consistent 100% passage rates on the areas contained in the Title II report.
- **Mr. Fuller** stated that work had begun on this issue in collaboration with the Tennessee Higher Education Commission; however, the agencies had just run out of time in order to meet the reports deadline.
- **Mr. Fuller** drew the Board's attention to the areas of Biology, Chemistry, Mathematics, and Physics and how only statewide totals are included in the report, due to the low number of graduates in each of these areas across the state.
- **Mr. Fuller** concluded by noting that in the area of Physics for the years spanning 2001-02 to 2005-06 the combined total of statewide graduates did not exceed 10 teachers.

B. Basic Education Program (BEP) Review Committee Report

Mr. Fuller provided an overview of the Executive Summary of the BEP Review Committee report. He emphasized that the primary emphasis of the report focused on Senate Joint Resolution 1180 and the issue of maintenance of effort. He reviewed the recommendation approved by the committee on page 6 of the executive summary, specifically noting the following change:

...”nor shall such LEA receive less funds from a local legislative body than it received in the previous fiscal year as adjusted for inflation based on the local government price deflator, which is an index used to adjust the Basic Education Program. However, if such index reflects an inflation rate of less than zero such decline shall be treated as no change in the inflation rate.”

Mr. Fuller reviewed the immediate priority recommendations of the Committee related to Administrative and Instructional technology. He emphasized the recommendation advocating adjusting the existing \$20 million allocation for technology so that it accounts for inflation by applying the funds to the reduction of technology coordinator ratios in the formula.

He also reviewed the immediate priority recommendations related to the addition of an instructional technology coordinator position within the formula along with the creation of a new component for instructional technology within the classroom category of the BEP.

As an extended priority, **Mr. Fuller** noted the addition of an administrative position within the BEP formula.

Finally, **Mr. Fuller** noted that the measures for salary disparity were decreasing.

III. Action Items (First Reading)

A. School Fees, Rule

Mr. Rich Haglund, State Board of Education, explained that the proposed rule changes clarify that LEAs may request, but not require any student to pay school fees as a condition of attending the public school or using its equipment.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved acceptance on first reading. **Vice Chair Pearre** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

B. Employees of the Special Schools, Rule

Mr. Haglund explained that these revisions combined two rule chapters and were revised to reduce confusion for teachers and other employees of the State special schools regarding grievance and appeal procedures for employment actions.

ACTION: **Vice Chair Pearre** moved acceptance on first reading. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

- C. Additional Endorsement Areas, Rule
REMOVED FROM AGENDA**
- D. Teacher Education Unit Programs/Licensure Areas
MOVED TO FINAL READING**
- E. Official List of Textbooks for Section III (Science, Health/Wellness,
PE, Agricultural Education, and Family & Consumer Services**

Dr. Connie Smith, Department of Education, presented the Official List of Textbooks for Science, Health/Wellness, Physical Education, Agricultural Education, and Family and Consumer Sciences. She stated that the textbooks were reviewed for (1) readability; (2) accuracy of content; and, (3) alignment of information to new standards. She noted that the list was well-vetted and she requested approval.

Mr. Ray asked if the Advisory Committee was schooled in the new rigor and asked for particulars regarding the approval process. **Dr. Smith** replied that practitioners serve to analyze the books before they are presented to the Textbook Commission.

Mr. Scott Eddins, Department of Education, added that a comprehensive overview of the standards goes to the teachers beforehand. **Mr. Eddins** also explained that the review is a tiered process that presents material to the Commission after practitioner review.

Dr. Wright asked if once a textbook is chosen, does every school use them?

Mr. Eddins replied that each LEA is provided a list of acceptable books to determine which books are acceptable to them.

Mr. Ray asked if there was much lobbying done by publishers. **Ms. Lynne Cohen**, Department of Education, responded that publishers present textbooks to the review team, reports are written by the team and publishers can contest a review. The Textbook Commission has the final say in which textbooks are approved.

ACTION: **Dr. Wright** moved acceptance on first reading. **Vice Chair Pearre** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

- F. Transitional License and Teacher Education Program Approval,
Rule**

Mr. Bruce Opie, Department of Education, presented this item and explained that this transitional license will replace the current Type I and II licenses. He noted that it opens up opportunities for those with a bachelor's degree to move into teaching with fewer obstacles.

Vice Chair Pearre asked about technical aspects of the document. **Mr. Opie** stated that a fully edited version of the document will clear confusion regarding components of the rule.

Chairman Rolston asked to see a flow chart or similar document that summarizes the various paths toward licensure. **Mr. Opie** replied that this would be available for Board members.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved acceptance on first reading. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

G. *Proposed Achievement Levels and Descriptors*

Mr. Eddins presented this item for first reading. This moves our performance measures from 3 to 4 areas. It adds a new level called "approaching proficient" between below and proficient.

Ms. Sloyan asked if this would more closely mirror NAEP. **Mr. Eddins** responded that it would.

Mr. Ray asked if we needed an "approaching proficiency" performance level. **Mr. Eddins** responded that we did because of performance levels of "proficient" being raised.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved acceptance on first reading. **Vice Chair Pearre** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

H. *Middle Grades Policy Study Committee*

Dr. Nixon presented this item. This proposed rule amendment directs schools to assess student readiness at three transitions: kindergarten to first, fourth to fifth, and eighth to ninth. It calls for those students who are deemed not ready to be provided with interventions to improve their readiness for the next grade. **Dr. Nixon** further noted that with the likelihood of systems not having the resources for the interventions due to budget reductions, we will have to refine this proposal but recommended that it move forward on first reading to continue the discussion.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved acceptance on first reading. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

IV. Action Items (Final Reading)

Teacher Education Unit Programs/Licensure Areas (Item III.D.)

Mr. Martin Nash, Department of Education, presented this item for final approval. He recommended Middle Tennessee State University and Milligan College continue on as licensing institutions. He noted that

MTSU has some noted weaknesses, but these should not jeopardize approval.

Mr. Ray asked why these weaknesses should be listed is they are not critical to the approval process. **Mr. Nash** responded that these are technical adjustments and alignments to curriculum and that by listing them that institutions will pay attention to these types of deficiencies.

Dr. Rogers commented about what would be necessary for institutions to have the capacity to correct these types of issues. **Vice Chair Pearre** asked Mr. Nash about specific results related to Praxis and noted that MTSU disputed the number of programs completers assigned to their university. He replied that the number has not been reconciled and was therefore reported in the document as such.

ACTION: **Mr. Barker** moved to approve. **Dr. Rogers** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

B. *Tennessee Education Leadership Redesign Licensure, Rule*

Dr. Nixon presented this item for final reading. He stated that the approved rule states that assistant principals, teaching principals, or dual assignment personnel with more than 50% of their responsibilities involved in instructional leadership hired before September 15, 2009, must hold a BAL or be enrolled in a State Board approved instructional leadership preparation program. Questions were asked about those hired after September 15, 2009. This amendment clarifies in section 6 that effective September 15, 2009, all assistant principals, etc. with 50% or more of their responsibilities involved in instructional leadership must be appropriately licensed or be enrolled in a State Board approved instructional leadership preparation program.

Second, the approved rules allow a current ten year license to be renewed once for five years. Further, for active principals, the PAL license must be converted to a ILL-P or ILL-E by September, 2015, or at the expiration of the license, whichever is longer. 2022 is the last year the approved rule would allow a PAL license to be effective. To clarify the confusion and make implementation clear, this proposed amendment in section 8 allows principals to maintain the PAL until July 1, 2022, at which time the ILL-B, ILL-P, or ILL-E would be required.

Vice Chair Pearre asked that the following words be inserted in number 8 - "If the candidate has met the requirements of the State Board of Education..."

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved to approve. **Ms. Sloyan** seconded. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

	Yes	No	Absent
Jim Ayers			X
Flavius Barker	X		
Vernita Justice	X		
Carolyn Pearre	X		
Dick Ray	X		
Jean Anne Rogers	X		
Fielding Rolston	X		
Teresa Sloyan	X		
Melvin Wright	X		
Brittini England	X		

The motion passed unanimously.

C. *Web Design Essentials and Web Design Applications Curriculum*

Ms. Cohen presented the business technology standards for Web Design Essentials and Web Design Applications for final reading.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved to approve. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

D. *Textile and Apparel Production and Service Management Licensure Standards*

Ms. Cohen presented the Family & Consumer Sciences, Textile and Apparel Production and Service Management add-on endorsement program standards.

ACTION: **Dr. Wright** moved to approve. **Vice Chair Pearre** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

E. *Tennessee School Board Association Training Module on Facilities*

Dr. David Sevier, State Board of Education, presented this item and noted that this is an elective training module regarding school facilities and is available to local school board members as part of the required school board training.

ACTION: **Vice Chair Pearre** moved to approve. **Dr. Rogers** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

F. *ISTE NETS•T*

Dr. Sevier presented this item and noted that these standards run parallel to the student version of these standards approved at the previous meeting.

ACTION: **Dr. Wright** moved to approve. **Vice Chair Pearre** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

G. *Tennessee School Bus Specifications: Amendment of Implementation Date Seats and Restraining Barriers, Passenger Seating, Section A.8*

Mr. Fuller reviewed the Board's past action of approving new school bus specifications with the understanding that the only major change was related to the requirement of a crossing control arm. Within the current year, it was brought to the attention of Board staff that the specifications also included a major change related to regulations impacting the type of seatbelts to be included on school buses. At the time this agenda item was approved, Board staff was not aware of this additional updated related to seatbelts.

The proposed amendment is to delay the implementation date for the new seatbelt restraint requirements to July 1, 2009.

ACTION: **Dr. Wright** moved to approve. **Mr. Barker** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

H. *Virtual Enterprise International Curriculum Standards*

Ms. Cohen presented this item to amend and add work-based learning standards to the current standards.

ACTION: **Mr. Ray** moved to approve. **Ms. Sloyan** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

I. *Policy on Distance Learning and e-Learning*

Dr. Sevier presented the amendment that clarifies the assignment of course codes for e-learning classes.

ACTION: **Vice Chair Pearre** moved to approve. **Dr. Wright** seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

VI. Teacher License Actions

- A. *David M. Alcantara – Revocation, minimum three (3) years***
- B. *Jennifer R. Cumisky – Suspension, one (1) year***
- C. *Ronald E. Davis – Denial of reinstatement request***
- D. *Dianne O. Dieterich – Revocation, permanent***
- E. *Tracy D. Hinson – Revocation, permanent***
- F. *Jim E. Hughes, Jr. – Revocation, permanent***
- G. *Summer B. Hyder – Revocation, permanent***
- H. *Jason C. McElveen – Suspension, one (1) year***
- I. *Ruth T. Patty - Reinstatement***

- J. **Anne E. Smith – Suspension, two (2) years**
- K. **Regina D. Steelman – Revocation, permanent**
- L. **Susan T. Wallace – Revocation, permanent**

Mr. Haglund noted that recommendations had been provided for all the suspension, revocation and reinstatement items. The review committee recommended denying Mr. Davis's reinstatement request because his letter did not seem to reflect an appreciation of the seriousness of the conviction or a sense of remorse.

ACTION: **Vice Chair Pearre** moved to approve. **Dr. Wright** seconded. A roll call vote was taken as follows:

	Yes	No	Absent
Jim Ayers			X
Flavius Barker	X		
Vernita Justice	X		
Carolyn Pearre	X		
Dick Ray	X		
Jean Anne Rogers	X		
Fielding Rolston	X		
Teresa Sloyan	X		
Melvin Wright	X		
Brittini England	X		

The motion passed unanimously.

VII. Adjournment

Chairman Rolston then thanked the Board members for their thoughtful deliberations and announced that the Board will meet next on January 29-30, 2009.

Approved by: _____ Date: _____