# Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph Commission Meeting

MINUTES of the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph Commission Meeting, held January 26, 2018, in Nashville Tennessee.

Walt Valentine

Walt Valentine, Chair

Paul David Brown Jr, Vice Chair

Stuart W Bayne

Larry T Flair, Sr.

**Robin Brewer Johnston** 

William Rick Jones

Arthur G (Jerry) Richards

Alan G Rousseau

**Douglas Shanks** 

### PRIVATE INVESTIGATION AND POLYGRAPH COMMISSION

# **EDUCATION MEETING**

January 26, 2018



Associate Reporter

Chattanooga (423) 266-2332 · Jackson (731) 425-1222 Knoxville (865) 329-9919 · Nashville (615) 595-0073 · Memphis (901) 522-4477 www.elitereportingservices.com

Page 7 Page 5 1 MS. VEST: I'll try to remember that. 1 had 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2 MS. JOHNSTON: I will too. 2 15, 16, 17, 18 -- they got 20 courses and they wanted 3 MS. VEST: Okav. 3 one hour continuing education for each. 4 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: We have all known 4 MR. ROUSSEAU: I'm okay with that. 5 her as Robin Brewer for years and years and years. 5 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Okay. 6 MS. VEST: Me too, that's why I was 6 MS. VEST: Mr. Flair? 7 7 asking. MR. FLAIR: Yes, ma'am, that will work. 8 The next one was PI Education, Untying 8 MS. VEST: The next one is DeVan & 9 the Knot: A Guide to Investigation Troubled 9 Associates, SLED and North Carolina Approved Private 10 Relationships. They wanted six hours. Investigator for Continued Education. They want to 10 11 MR. ROUSSEAU: Aren't they on our 11 have that approved for their education for February 12 approved list? 12 the 22nd and 23rd of this year. 13 13 MR. ROUSSEAU: I'm okay. MS. VEST: The PI Education is, yes, but 14 these different courses have to be approved to get on 14 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Do we have more 15 there. 15 material, than the ones that we have? 16 MR. ROUSSEAU: I am okay with it. 16 MS. VEST: That's all we have. 17 MS. VEST: Did you have any questions 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I would have liked 18 about it? 18 to have seen a little bit more. 19 MR. ROUSSEAU: No. 19 MS. VEST: If you do, we have time to ask 20 them, but then I won't have time to bring it back to MS. VEST: Mr. Flair, did you? 20 21 MR. FLAIR: No, ma'am. 21 the Commission. 22 MS. VEST: The other one is also PI --22 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Yeah. 23 23 there's several PI Education. Open Source MS. VEST: So what would you like for me 24 Intelligence, six hours; Public -- PI Education, It's 24 to look for? 25 All Lies: Understanding Deception Detection, six 25 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Have they --Page 8 1 hours. The next one is E-Q-U-I-V-O-C-A-L Death MS. VEST: Yeah, it's the North Carolina 1 2 Investigations for six hours. Then we have Identity 2 Private Investigators that are putting it on. 3 Theft for six hours; Surveillance Strategies for MR. FLAIR: I don't have a problem with 3 4 Success, one hour: Ethics and Professional 4 it. 5 Responsibility for two hours. 5 MR. ROUSSEAU: I'm okay with it. 6 Do you have any problems with the PI 6 MS. VEST: Are you, Mr. Brown? 7 Education courses? 7 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Okay. 8 MR. ROUSSEAU: No problem. 8 MS. VEST: Okay. I can check on it, if 9 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: None. 9 you wish, but I won't --10 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I just think in the MR. FLAIR: No. 10 MS. VEST: The next one is for Charles 11 11 future we need --12 Pepper -- Piper, P-I-P-E-R, Contracting Procurement 12 MS. VEST: More information? 13 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Everybody else is 13 Fraud Investigation Guidebook. They wanted 12 hours 14 for that. 14 getting it to us, why shouldn't --15 MR. ROUSSEAU: No problem. 15 MS. VEST: Just give me a moment here and VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Hasn't he been 16 16 let me look at it. VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Looked like a good 17 approved before? 17 18 MS. VEST: Yes. Mr. Flair, do you have 18 program. 19 any problem? MS. VEST: You didn't think it was 19 20 MR. FLAIR: Yeah, I didn't have any 20 enough? It's got the whole program. problem. That's what I was thinking, I thought he VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Oh, it does? When 21 21 22 had already been approved. 22 I printed it out, I didn't see is it then. MS. VEST: I understand, but the course 23 MS. VEST: Okay. It's got the hours, 23 24 it's broken it down, and it's even giving you what 24 has to too. And then here is the NRTS submitted --25 courses they are going to teach. And Mr. Hubbard is 25 they submitted their courses for 2018. You saw they

```
Page 9
   the president, he will be teaching. I think it's got
2
   ample, maybe you just didn't see all of it.
3
           VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Or my printer
   didn't print it all out.
5
           MS. VEST: That's possible. But we say
6
   it's okay.
7
           VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Yes, ma'am.
8
           MR. FLAIR: Yes.
9
           MS. VEST: All right, not a problem. And
10
   the next one and last one is Kansas Association of
11
    Investigators. They are having their conference
   February the 22nd and 23rd also, and they want
12
13 16 hours for their investigative --
14
           MR. ROUSSEAU: I'm okay with it.
15
           VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Okay.
16
           MR. FLAIR: I'm all right with it.
17
           MS. VEST: All right. Then I think that
18 finishes our continuing education. And what we'll
19 do, whenever we present this, Mr. Brown, we'll just
20 say, "All the courses had been approved by the
21 Commission," and we will ask the members if they will
22 approve it.
23
           (WHEREUPON, the meeting was concluded at
24
    9:12 a.m.)
25
                                                Page 10
```

```
1
                     REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
2
    STATE OF TENNESSEE
3
     COUNTY OF SUMNER
5
             I, JENNY CHECUGA, Licensed Court Reporter,
6
    with offices in Nashville, Tennessee, and Registered
     Professional Reporter, hereby certify that I reported
A
     the foregoing Education Committee Meeting by machine
9
     shorthand to the best of my skills and abilities, and
10
    thereafter the same was reduced to typewritten form
11
12
             I further certify that I am not related to
13
    any of the parties named herein, nor their counsel,
    and have no interest, financial or otherwise, in the
14
15
    outcome of the proceedings.
16
          I further certify that in order for this
    document to be considered a true and correct copy, it
17
    must bear my original signature and that any
     unauthorized reproduction in whole or in part and/or
     transfer of this document is not authorized, will not
     be considered authentic, and will be in violation of
19
    Tennessee Code Annotated 39-14-104, Theft of
     Services.
20
21
22
               JENNY CHECUGA, ACR, RPR
               Elite Reporting Services
23
               Licensed Court Reporter (TN)
24
               Notary Public State of Tennessee
25
               My Notary Commission Expires: 5/22/2019
               LCR #690 - Expires: 6/30/2018
```

1	9	conference 9:11 Continued 7:10	good 4:8 8:17 Guide 5:9
4			Guide 5:9  Guidebook 6:13
<b>1</b> 7:1	9 7:1	continuing 3:13,23 4:13 7:3 9:18	
<b>10</b> 7:1	<b>9:12</b> 9:24	Contracting 6:12	Gulf 3:10
<b>11</b> 7:1	<b>A</b>	courses 5:14 6:7,25 7:2	Н
<b>12</b> 3:12,14 6:13 7:1		8:25 9:20	3-12-11
<b>13</b> 7:1	<b>A-D-V-O-C-A-C-Y</b> 3:10		happened 3:5
<b>14</b> 7:1	<b>a.m.</b> 9:24	D	hour 6:4 7:3
<b>15</b> 7:2	actual 3:8	Death 6:1	<b>hours</b> 3:12,14,23 4:4,13 5:10,24 6:1,2,3,5,13 8:23
<b>16</b> 7:2 9:13	ample 9:2	Deception 5:25	9:13
<b>17</b> 7:2	apologize 3:5	Detection 5:25	Hubbard 8:25
<b>18</b> 7:2	approve 9:22	Devan 7:8	
2	approved 5:12,14 6:17,	Development 4:3	1
2	22 7:9,11 9:20	differences 4:8	Identity 6:2
<b>2</b> 7:1	Associates 7:9	Douglas 4:18	individual 3:13
<b>20</b> 7:2	Association 9:10		information 3:4 8:12
<b>2018</b> 6:25	В	E	Intelligence 5:24
<b>22nd</b> 7:12 9:12		<b>E-Q-U-I-V-O-C-A-L</b> 6:1	introduce 4:19
<b>23rd</b> 7:12 9:12	<b>back</b> 7:20	Ed 3:22 4:2,13	Investigation 5:9 6:13
	<b>bit</b> 7:18		Investigations 6:2
3	Board 3:20	Edge 3:22 4:2,12	investigative 9:13
<b>3</b> 7:1	Brewer 4:21 5:5	education 3:13,23 4:14 5:8,13,23,24 6:7 7:3,10,	Investigator 7:10
	<b>bring</b> 7:20	11 9:18	
4	broken 8:24	Ethics 6:4	Investigators 8:2 9:11
<b>4</b> 7:1	<b>Brown</b> 3:17 4:1,5,10,15	F	J
4 7.1	5:4 6:9,16 7:5,14,17,22, 25 8:6,7,10,13,17,21 9:3,		
5	7,15,19	February 7:11 9:12	Johnston 4:20,21,22,25 5:2
	<b>business</b> 3:24 4:3,6	finishes 9:18	
<b>5</b> 7:1		Flair 3:11,16 5:20,21	K
6	C	6:10,18,20 7:6,7 8:3 9:8, 16	Kansas 9:10
111111111111111111111111111111111111111	call 4:20	Fraud 6:13	
<b>6</b> 7:1	Carolina 7:9 8:1	full 3:21	<b>Knot</b> 5:9
7	Center 3:10	future 8:11	L
	Charles 6:11	idealo 0.11	
<b>7</b> 7:1	check 8:8	G	Laws 4:14
	<b>Commission</b> 3:21 7:21	mine 0.45	Leading 3:22 4:2,12
8	9:21	give 8:15	Legal 3:22 4:2,13
<b>8</b> 7:1	concluded 9:23	giving 8:24	Lies 5:25

list 5:12 **Private** 7:9 8:2 T LLC 3:22 4:2 problem 3:14,24,25 4:5, 15 6:8,15,19,21 8:3 9:9 long 3:4 teach 8:25 problems 6:6 looked 4:8 8:17 teaching 9:1 Procurement 6:12 test 4:10 M Professional 4:3 6:4 Theft 6:3 program 8:18,20 marketing 4:6 thinking 6:21 **Promoting** 3:23 material 7:15 thought 6:21 Protecting 4:3 means 4:8 time 7:19,20 Public 5:24 meet 3:7 Troubled 5:9 putting 8:2 meeting 3:7,8,20 9:23 member 4:17 Q members 9:21 understand 6:23 questions 5:17 moment 4:18 8:15 Understanding 4:14 5:25 month 3:7 R Untying 5:8 received 3:3 V record 4:24 newest 4:17 Region 3:10 **VEST** 3:2,12,18 4:2,7,12, North 7:98:1 17,23 5:1,3,6,13,17,20, Relationships 5:10 NRTS 6:24 22 6:11, 18, 23 7:6, 8, 16, remember 5:1 19,23 8:1,6,8,12,15,19, 23 9:5.9.17 0 Responsibility 6:5 VICE-CHAIRMAN 3:17 Robin 5:5 **Open** 5:23 4:1,5,10,15 5:4 6:9,16 **ROUSSEAU** 3:15,25 7:5,14,17,22,25 8:7,10, opinion 3:21 5:11,16,19 6:8,15 7:4,13 13,17,21 9:3,7,15 8:5 9:14 opportunity 3:9 vote 3:20.21 S Р W Shanks 4:18 P-I-P-E-R 6:12 wanted 4:13 5:10 6:13 **SLED** 7:9 7:2 Pepper 6:12 **sort** 3:4 work 7:7 PI 5:8,13,22,23,24 6:6 Source 5:23 Piper 6:12 Υ Strategies 6:3 present 9:19 **submitted** 6:24,25 president 9:1 year 7:12 Success 6:4 print 9:4 years 5:5 Surveillance 6:3 printed 8:22 printer 9:3 Privacy 4:14

### PRIVATE INVESTIGATION AND POLYGRAPH COMMISSION

## **COMMISSION MEETING**

January 26, 2018



JENNY CHECUGA, LCR, RPR Associate Reporter

Chattanooga (423) 266-2332 · Jackson (731) 425-1222 Knoxville (865) 329-9919 · Nashville (615) 595-0073 · Memphis (901) 522-4477 www.elitereportingservices.com

		Page
1	TO YUN TO THE TANK OF THE TANK	1 INDEX
2	PRIVATE INVESTIGATION AND POLYGRAPH COMMISSION	2
3	COMMISSION MEETING	3 Call to Order
4	January 26, 2018	Page 4
5	DAVY CROCKETT TOWER	Legal Report
_	500 JAMES ROBERTSON PARKWAY, ROOM 1A	5 Page 12
6	NASHVILLE, TN 37243	6 Appearances
_		Page 27
7		7
3		Administrative Matters
)		8 Page 47
)		9 Education Report
Ľ		Page 56
1		10
ĺ		Unfinished Business
	TRANSCRIPT OF COMMISSION MEETING	11 Page 57
i	Commencing at 9:30 a.m.	12 New Business
		Page 57
		13
		Adjournment
		14 Page 58
ĺ		15
		16
		17
		_ 18
	Elite Reporting Services	19
		20
	www.elitereportingservices.com	21
	Jenny Checuga, LCR, RPR	22
Į	Post Office Box 292382	23
	Nashville, Tennessee 37229	24
5	(615)595-0073	25
	Page	2 Page
1		1 * * *
	APPEARANCES	2 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Good morning,
2		3 fellow Commission members, staff members, and honor
1	COMMISSION MEMBERS	
	Walt Valentine, Chair	4 guests. Today is February the 26th, 2018, at
	Paul David Brown, Jr., Vice-Chair	5 approximately 9:31. I'm David Brown, your Commission
	Larry T. Flair, Sr.	
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston ALSO PRESENT Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer? 21 MS. BREWER: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer? 21 MS. BREWER: Here. 22 MS. VEST: Rick Jones? Jerry Richards?
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer? 21 MS. BREWER: Here. 22 MS. VEST: Rick Jones? Jerry Richards? 23 MR. RICHARDS: Here.
	Larry T. Flair, Sr. Jerry Richards Alan G. Rousseau Douglas Shanks Stuart Bayne Robin Brewer-Johnston  ALSO PRESENT  Ashley Thomas, Staff Attorney Stuart Huffman, Staff Attorney Cody Vest, Executive Director	6 Vice-Chair. I will now call to order the meeting of 7 the Tennessee Private Investigation and Polygraph 8 Commission, and turn it over to Cody Vest. 9 MS. VEST: All right, thank you. We are 10 going to do a rollcall. But first of all, we need to 11 say hello to our newest Commission member, who is 12 Douglas Shanks. Appreciate Mr. Shanks taking his 13 time to serve on the Commission. I am going to do a 14 rollcall. Stuart Bayne? 15 MR. BAYNE: Here. 16 MS. VEST: David Brown? 17 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Here. 18 MS. VEST: Larry Flair? 19 MR. FLAIR: Here. 20 MS. VEST: Robin Brewer? 21 MS. BREWER: Here. 22 MS. VEST: Rick Jones? Jerry Richards?

Page 7 Page 5 1 MS. VEST: Walt Valentine? MR. VALENTINE: I think it would be fine 1 2 MR. VALENTINE: Here. 2 to go ahead and let --3 MS. VEST: Doug Shanks? 3 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I agree. 4 MR. SHANKS: Here. 4 MR. BAYNE: That's fine too. That's 5 MS. VEST: Let the record show that 5 okay. Mr. Jones is not present, but you do have a guorum. 6 MS. VEST: So --7 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Thank you, ma'am. 7 MR. ROUSSEAU: I move that we go ahead 8 The next item is the agenda for approval. I'd like 8 and have the election. to ask if each Commission member has received and had 9 MS. VEST: Okay, you want to go -- okay, time to review a copy of the agenda, and if so, is 10 that's fine. I just wanted to make sure. All right. there a motion to adopt this agenda. 11 11 I do have a script, if you'll allow me to read by it. 12 MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks makes a motion Okay. Well, I am calling for the nominations for the 13 to adopt the agenda. 13 Commission Chair. Do we have any nominations? 14 MR. ROUSSEAU: Second. 14 MR. RICHARDS: Yes, I'd like to nominate 15 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Motion by Doug 15 Walt Valentine. 16 Shanks, second by Larry Flair -- no, Alan Rousseau, 16 MS. VEST: That is Mr. Valentine, and he 17 I'm sorry. Any discussion? All in favor? 17 was nominated by Mr. Richards. Is there a second to 18 THE COMMISSION: Aye. the nomination? 18 19 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Motion carries. MR. BAYNE: Second. 19 20 Next we have our minutes for approval from the MS. VEST: Who did the second? 20 21 September 22, 2017, minutes, and these are minutes 21 MR. BAYNE: Bayne. 22 for both the Education Committee and the 22 MS. VEST: Are there any other 23 Commissioners Meeting. I'd like to ask if each 23 nominations? 24 Commission member has received and had time to review 24 MR. ROUSSEAU: I'd like to nominate 25 a copy of those minutes, and if so, is there a motion 25 Mr. Brown. Page 6 Page 8 1 to adopt those minutes? MR. SHANKS: Second. 1 2 MR. BAYNE: So made. 2 MS. VEST: Okav. We have Mr. Brown by 3 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Motion by 3 Alan Rousseau. And who was the second? 4 Commissioner Stuart Bayne. 4 MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks. 5 5 MR. VALENTINE: Second. MS. VEST: Mr. Shanks. Do we have any 6 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Commissioner 6 other nominations? Let me get down to the part here 7 Richards -- no, Valentine, second. Any discussion? 7 where I need to tell you what we are going to do 8 All in favor? 8 next. 9 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 9 At this time we'll call for a vote for 10 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Opposed? Motion 10 the Commission Chair. Since we do have two individuals, the last time we did one of these, we carries. For the next item on the agenda, we are 11 going to turn it over to Executive Director Cody did this as a private vote where you have a pad in 13 Vest. front of you. That's what -- that's the way I would 13 14 MS. VEST: The next thing on your agenda 14 prefer to do that. 15 So please, we have Walt Valentine, who's 15 is election of officers, it's the first meeting of the new year. We do have a Commission member absent, been nominated, and Mr. Brown -- David Brown's been 16 16 Mr. Jones is not present, so my duty is to ask you if 17 nominated. you want to go ahead and vote officers, or do you 18 (Passing papers.) 19 want to wait until our next meeting when we have a 19 MS. VEST: We have a vote for Walt 20 full Commission? 20 Valentine, Walt Valentine, Mr. Brown, David Brown, David Brown, David Brown, Walt Valentine, and Walt 21 MR. BAYNE: I would recommend waiting 21 Valentine. Why did you all make me go off script; it 22 until we have a full Commission. 22 doesn't tell me what to do. 23 MS. VEST: So on the record, Mr. Bayne 23 24 MR. RICHARDS: Arm wrestle. 24 has said we need to -- it'd be okay to wait -- how

MS. VEST: Okay. We can have another

25

25 does anybody else feel? Do we have any discussion?

Page 9

1 vote, or if it's going to split again, we may have to 2 wait until we have another Commission member, which makes it, what, nine members.

4 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Let me go ahead and 5 let Walt be the Chairman.

MS. VEST: You want to remove your name 6 7 from the nomination?

VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Yes, ma'am.

9 MS. VEST: Mr. Rousseau, since you did 10 the nomination, you would have to remove him.

11 MR. ROUSSEAU: I move to withdraw my

12 nomination.

8

13

15

22

25

1

9

15

16

25

MS. VEST: For David Brown as Commission

14 Chair. All right. Do we have a second?

MR. SHANKS: Second.

16 MS. VEST: Who did the second? All

17 right, Mr. Shanks, thank you. So now we are back to

Walt Valentine was nominated. Since there's no other

individual that has been nominated, do I have a vote 19

20 for election by acclimation for Walt Valentine?

21 MR. ROUSSEAU: I so move.

MS. VEST: All right, the motion was made

23 by Alan Rousseau. Second by?

24 MR. BAYNE: Second.

MS. VEST: Mr. Bayne seconded that?

Chairman. 1

2

6

15

3

MS. VEST: Mr. Flair, thank you.

3 MS. BREWER: Second.

4 MS. VEST: Ms. Brewer has seconded the

5 nomination. All in favor?

THE COMMISSION: Aye.

7 MS. VEST: The motion has carried, the 8 election has ceased. Congratulations, Mr. Brown, you

9 are now the Vice-Chair, which I think you already are

10 the Vice-Chair.

11 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Yes, ma'am, I

12 maintain my seat.

MS. VEST: I think you need to just move 13

iust a little bit, now it's Mr. Valentine. 14

VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: With pleasure.

16 MS. VEST: Mr. Shanks, would you move over a little bit and let Mr. Brown sit in your chair 17

and Walt can take your chair. All right, we may need 18

19 to move these little name tags, too. See, this is a

20 test, gentlemen.

21 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: It's complicated.

22 MS. VEST: Yes, it is. Congratulations

23 to both gentlemen. Walt Valentine is now the Chair

of the Private Investigation and Polygraph

25 Commission, and David Brown is your Vice-Chair of the

Page 10

MR. BAYNE: Yes. ma'am.

2 MS. VEST: Then the vote is going to

3 cease and we have a new Chair and that is Walt

4 Valentine. Congratulations, Mr. Valentine, you are 5 now the Chair for the Private Investigation and

6 Polygraph Commission, which is no stranger to you

7 because you were the North Carolina, wasn't it,

8 Chair?

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Indiana.

10 MS. VEST: Indiana, excuse me. I knew it

was up north. All right, now we need to vote for a 11

12 Vice-Chair. 13

MR. ROUSSEAU: I move for Commissioner

14 Brown for Vice-Chair.

MR. BAYNE: Second.

MS. VEST: We have a nomination for David

17 Brown as Vice-Chair -- and who was that? 18

MR. BAYNE: Second.

19 MS. VEST: You did the second. Who did

20 the vote? Alan Rousseau? Okay. And then Mr. Bayne

21 did the second. Do we have any other nominations?

22 All right. Since there are no other nominations, we

23 will call for a vote of acclimation. Do we have a

24 motion?

MR. FLAIR: I make that motion, Madam

Page 12 Private Investigation and Polygraph Commission.

2 Congratulations, gentlemen.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Thank you, I guess.

4 MS. VEST: The next thing I think we need

5 to do. Mr. Chairman, is the Roberts Rules of Order. There is a new -- Roberts Rules of Order has changed

a little bit. We used to say that we would change it

8 so that the Commission Chair could vote, now it is

9 Roberts Rules of Order that says the Chairman may

vote. We need to elect Roberts Rules of Order. 10

11 MR. ROUSSEAU: I move that we accept the 12

Roberts Rules of Order. 13 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I second.

14 MS. VEST: Alan Rousseau did the motion,

David Brown made the second. All in favor? 15

16 THE COMMISSION: Aye.

17 MS. VEST: All opposed? Motion carries.

18 Now we are down to the legal section.

19 MS. THOMAS: If the Commission's ready,

20 I'll begin reading the legal report. I will start

with case number one, being 2017061831 and 21

22 2017061811.

23 This complaint opened alleging that

24 Respondent entered into a contract for private

investigation services and to provide requested

Page 13 information in order to enforce a court judgement. 2 Complainant, a licensed realtor, indicated that some 3 of the information that Respondent provided was

available to him prior to contracting. Complainant

stated that Respondent provided minimal information 6 and would not provide any information unless

contacted. Complainant stated he last contacted

Respondent on August 10, 2017, via text message for an update on the status of the case. Complainant

stated that he paid Respondent \$4,000, but did not 10 11 provide any useful results.

12 Respondent stated that Complainant, after 13 missing the first two meetings, hired him to conduct 14 an asset search about two people. Respondent stated 15 that through September 2017, the investigation was 16 ongoing, and the Complainant was informed that the 17 case could take 30 to 90 days to complete. 18 Respondent stated that Complainant provided first and 19 last names and addresses. Respondent stated that 20 additional leads were developed and discoveries were 21 made. Respondent stated that multiple telephone

calls were made between the parties. 23 Respondent stated that after receiving 24 the complaint, he reached out to Complainant to address any outstanding issues. Respondent stated 1 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 2 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Opposed? Motion 3 carries. 4

MS. THOMAS: Case number two, 2017063461 5 and 2017063441. This complaint opened alleging that 6 Respondent 1 was hired on a sensitive matter. 7 Complainant states that Respondent 2, after receiving 8 a \$500 retainer, failed to return any multiple phone 9

calls or texts. The Complainant is seeking a refund. 10 Respondent 2 stated that the Complainant 11 paid the \$500, which entitled the Complainant to 6.67 12 hours. Respondent 2 stated that on six different 13 occasions services were conducted and the female subject cannot be confirmed. Respondent 2 stated 14 15 that a written report was mailed to Complainant on August 11, 2017. Respondent stated that since the 16 17 mailing of the written report, there has been no communication with Complainant. Respondent also 19 indicated that the address listed on the complaint form by Complainant was never provided. 20

21 Complainant, in a rebuttal to 22 Respondent's reply, stated that Respondent received 23 the retainer, but did not earn the money.

Complainant states that subsequent investigators were 24

hired after Respondent provided no results.

Page 14

- 1 that Complainant did not hire the company on an
- 2 exclusive basis, there was not a timeframe to be
- 3 completed, and the agreement did not require updates
- 4 to be provided throughout the investigation.
- 5 Respondent indicated that several attempts to reach
- 6 Complainant went unanswered, a fact which Complainant
- 7 disputes. Respondent acknowledged that Complainant
- was last contacted on August 102017, but because
- 9 there was no subsequent follow-up, there is no
- 10 evidence of a concern.

22

11 My recommendation is to issue a letter of 12 warning regarding Tennessee Comprehensive Rules and 13 Regulations 1175-04-.06(4), which is misconduct, and 14 close. While there is little to no evidence which 15 supports the amount of contact between Respondent and 16 Complainant, neither party indicated that an itemized

17 statement of services and expenses was provided at

18 the latest being after the August 10, 2017,

19 communication.

20

21

23

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? MR. RICHARDS: I move that we accept

22 Counsel's recommendation.

MR. ROUSSEAU: Second.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay, I call for a 24

25 vote. All in favor say aye.

1 Complainant stated that Respondent had the correct

2 address, but is using that information as an excuse

for a lack of communication. Complainant then

provided an unsigned copy of the contract with

Respondent, as well as a screen shot of text messages

6 to the Respondent. It appears that Complainant did

7 reach out to Respondent on several occasions with no 8 response.

9 The contract indicates that Respondent would provide Complainant with verbal updates within 10 24 hours, written updates within 48 hours, and a 11 written report within ten days of a case completion. 12 13 There is no evidence that Respondent complied with 14 this portion of the contract.

My recommendation is to issue a letter of 15 warning to Respondent regarding Tennessee 16 17 Comprehensive Rules and Regulations 1175-04-.06(4), being misconduct.

18 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? 19 20 MS. BREWER: I'll motion.

21 MS. VEST: Ms. Brewer, please speak in 22 the microphone.

MS. BREWER: I'll make that motion to 23 24 accept the recommendation.

25 MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks, second.

Page 20

Page 17 1 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: It's been moved and 2 seconded. I'll call for the vote. All in favor? 3 THE COMMISSION: Ave. 4 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion carries. 5 6 MS. THOMAS: Case number three actually 7 belongs to your new disciplinary counsel. Mr. Stuart 8 Huffman, I'll go ahead and let him present his cases 9 to you. 10 MR. HUFFMAN: Number three is number 11 2017072891 and 2017072841. This is related to 12 2017063461. 13 Complainant alleges that Respondent is 14 having an affair with her husband. However, 15 according to the Respondent, the husband stated he 16 was divorced, but she recently found out he was 17 actually separated. Husband has asked -- it says 18 Complainant, but should be Respondent, to marry him, 19 but has been abusive. Complainant continues to try 20 to reach out to Respondent 2, even though Respondent 21 2 doesn't want to be communicated. 22 The recommendation is to close. 23

VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I recommend we

1 licensed attorney located in west Tennessee to review, approve, and sign all locator contracts 3 and/or claims with no question from the Tennessee Unclaimed Property Division. 4 5 A contract was submitted with the 6 complaint. The contract appears to be between 7 Respondent and the party seeking unclaimed property. 8 Respondent company is paid a contingency upon the 9 client receiving funds. There is a signature block for the named west Tennessee attorney. However, 11 there is no indication that Respondent company is working on behalf of that attorney. 12 13 My recommendation is to authorize a 14 formal hearing and send a consent order with a civil penalty in the amount of \$500 for violation of 16 Tennessee Code Annotated 62-26-204(a), which would be 17 the unlicensed activity statute. 18 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? 19 MR. BAYNE: I make a motion to approve 20 the recommendation. 21 MR. ROUSSEAU: I second. 22 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All in favor? 23 THE COMMISSION: Ave. 24 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 25 carries.

Page 18 1 MR. RICHARDS: I'll second. 2 MS. VEST: On the record, who is going to 3 do the second? 4 MR. RICHARDS: I'll second. 5 MS. VEST: Mr. Richards. 6 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: It's been moved and 7 seconded that we approve Counsel. All in favor say 8 9 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 10 MR. VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion carries. Number four. 11 12 MS. THOMAS: Case Number four is actually 13 my case. That is 2017063421. 14

24 accept Counsel's recommendations.

MS. BREWER: Second.

25

This complaint opened alleging that 15 Respondent is operating as a private investigator 16 without a license. Complainant states that 17 Respondent assists people with recovering money, 18 specifically through Tennessee Unclaimed Property 19 Fund. Complainant states that the Respondent enters 20 into contracts with individuals and receives payment 21 for services.

22 Respondent states that the company acts 23 as an asset recovery firm and has been approved as a locator by the Tennessee Unclaimed Property Division 24 25 since 2011. Respondent states that it has used a

2 Complainant alleges unlicensed activity and harassment by Respondent. Respondent was licensed at 4 the time of his investigation of state and federal 5 securities and criminal fraud, along with money 6 laundering, the allegation against Complainant. 7 The investigation took place from 2013 8 mostly in West Virginia, but Tennessee and Kentucky 9 had a reciprocal agreement allowing investigations to 10 cross the state borders without the need for testing. 11 Respondent admits he did not handle the 12 investigations in Tennessee, except a brief period in 13 2015 in which he was licensed.

Recommendation to the Board is to close.

MR. HUFFMAN: Number five is 2017075461.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? 15 16 MR. ROUSSEAU: I move to accept the 17 recommendation of Counsel. 18 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Second. 19 Commissioner Brown. 20 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: It's been moved and 21 seconded. I'll have a rollcall. All in favor say

23 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 24 MR. VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 25 carries.

1

14

22

ave.

Page 24

Page 21 MS. THOMAS: We do have a couple of re-presents for the Commission. The first is 2014024061. I will read the summary from the

4 original presentation, then give the new information. The complaint alleged that Respondent, a

6 website that styles itself as America's Premier 7 Resource for Private Investigators, Searches, and Lookups, was advertising that they were conducting

9 background checks by using licensed private 10 investigators. The website states they rely upon

1

2

3

5

14

9

19

20

11 information secured by real licensed private

12 investigators with access to information typically 13 reserved for law enforcement.

This complaint alleged that Respondent 15 was in violation of Tennessee Code Annotated 16 62-26-202 and 204, both which prohibit acting as an 17 investigations company without first obtaining a 18 license from the Commission. The investigation

19 revealed that Respondent had a current license in

20 Virginia, as well as one in Florida. Among other 21 services, the Respondent offered to obtain Tennessee

22 vehicle registration information for a fee on its 23 website.

24 Although the investigator identified six 25 Tennessee attorneys who appeared to have used the one more re-present.

2 MR. HUFFMAN: The last case is 3

2016070531. This case rises out of a consumer

4 complaint for unlicensed activity, specifically the

5 Complainant alleges that Respondent posed as a

licensed PI, questioned several of his employees.

7 Respondent was the owner of a PI company. Both the

individual's and company's licenses were revoked in 8

9 2013. Although Complainant filed separate complaints

10 against both Respondent 1 and his company, all the

allegations in the complaint are against Respondent 1 11

12 as an individual, here and after Respondent.

13 Respondent is a former employee of 14 Complainant agency's bail bond business. Complainant

15 terminated Respondent's employment for cause on

November 8, 2016. On November 21, 2016, Respondent 16

17 returned to the bail bond company claiming that he

18 was planted as a double agent hired by a surety

19 company with which Complainant was engaged in a 20 contractual dispute.

21 The surety company stated that they hired 22 Respondent as a bail enforcement agent. The surety

23 company then requested that Respondent perform work

for Complainant to learn about Complainant's business 24

practices and outstanding forfeitures. The surety

Respondent's services, when contacted by the 2 investigator, none of the attorneys could recall doing so. 3

4 The previous recommendation was to 5 authorize a formal hearing and send a consent order with a civil penalty in the amount of \$1,000 for that 7 unlicensed activity, which the Commission concurred with. This particular matter was re-presented at one

10 Subsequent to that, the Tennessee 11 Division of Motor Vehicles began offering that 12 service to Tennessee residents and nonresidents. The 13 new recommendation from the disciplinary counsel is 14 to close this matter, as it's allowed in the statute 15 now, this particular activity.

point and it was going to be scheduled for a hearing.

16 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? 17 MR. ROUSSEAU: I move to accept the

18 recommendation of Counsel.

MS. BREWER: Second.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Moved and seconded.

21 I call for a vote. All in favor say aye. 22

THE COMMISSION: Aye.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 23

24 carries. 25

MS. THOMAS: Thank you. I think we have

company also asked Respondent to question

2 Complainant's employees regarding Complainant's

potential illegal company. The surety company denies

4 they hired Respondent to be a licensed private

5 investigator. Respondent claims that he never

presented himself as a Pl. 6

7 Previous recommendation for 2016070531

8 was a \$500 civil penalty with formal charges

9 authorized for violation of Section 62-6-204(8),

unlicensed activity. Recommendation for 2016070571 10

11 was closed. The previous Commission's decision was

12 concurred.

13 Update is the certified mailing of

14 consent order has been mailed three times to two

15 separate addresses. The first address was vacant and

16 no mail receptacle, the second address was

17 undeliverable. The surety company informed the

18 Department that the Respondent is no longer employed

19 or represented. The separation apparently was not

20 amicable. Updated contact information on the

Respondent was requested from the surety company. 21

22 However, that information's the same as what we have

on file. The new recommendation is to flag and 23

24 close.

25 MR. BAYNE: Question. What is meant by

Page 25

1 "flag?"

6

7

2 MR. HUFFMAN: If the Respondent is to try 3 to apply for a new license, then we would know about

that and he would have to come in front of the

5 Commission.

MR. BAYNE: I understand, thank you.

MS. THOMAS: Additionally, it would

8 re-open this complaint for the Board's

9 reconsideration for any further discipline. But it's

10 closing now because I believe Stuart indicated that

11 the license has expired, so at this point he can't

12 practice as a private investigator. Should he decide

13 to become licensed again, as Stuart said, he would

14 have to answer this complaint and settle this before

15 receiving that license.

16 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Was he licensed when

17 this activity took place?

MR. HUFFMAN: He was not licensed. His

19 license was revoked in 2013, this activity was in

20 2016.

18

21

6

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay.

22 MS. THOMAS: So it sounds like it was

unlicensed activity at that time, but we do have a

license that we can flag, should he decide to try to 24

25 become licensed again.

1 working with Ashley. He will be presenting your

2 legal cases from now on. He will be also doing the

litigation, if necessary. Legal has divided up.

Ashley Thomas is an Assistant General Counsel, and

she assists us mostly with our day-to-day operations,

everything else has been turned over to Stuart

7 Huffman. We'd like to say, welcome. Stuart, to the

8 Commission.

10

13

25

9 MR. HUFFMAN: Thank you.

THE COMMISSION: Welcome.

11 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Thank you, Ashley,

12 for being with us for this period.

MR. BAYNE: Yes.

14 MS. THOMAS: Absolutely, my pleasure.

15 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Next on the agenda

16 is the appearance.

17 MS. VEST: Is Mr. Killian in here? Okay.

18 I think we can probably go ahead, even though the

gentleman's not here. His name is Kyle, K-Y-L-E, 19

last name is K-I-L-I-A-N. You have this on your 20

21 legal pad. This gentleman, I believe, is in law

22 enforcement. And we have had discussion before, and

you told me you wanted to look at the applications

24 for law enforcement.

I am also the director for the private --

Page 26

1 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a motion? 2 MS. THOMAS: I'm sorry. I was just going

to say, I think the bigger issue for Stuart is that we tried multiple times to serve him, and we couldn't

5 locate him.

VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Commissioner Brown.

7 I move we accept Counsel's recommendations. 8

MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks, second.

9 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Moved and seconded.

10 Call for a --

11 MS. VEST: I'm sorry, who? Mr. Brown was

12 first, you made the motion, and then Mr. Shanks

13 seconded?

14 MR. SHANKS: (Nodding head

15 affirmatively.)

MS. VEST: I'm sorry for interrupting.

17 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All in favor say

18 ave.

16

19

20

THE COMMISSION: Aye.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion

21 carries.

22 MS. VEST: I am sorry, I have been

23 remiss, I did not introduce your counsel. The

24 gentleman is Stuart Huffman, this week. I'm just

teasing, Stuart. No, we are pleased to have Stuart

1 for Private Protective Services, and I do get law enforcement that comes in and wants to do their own 2

3 companies and they want to do this for private

4 investigators as well.

We always look at the law enforcement 5 6

officer to see if he's worked in investigations. We 7 are aware that law enforcement -- it is investigation

and it is security, but not exactly investigations. 8

So I brought this before you today. He was supposed 9

10 to appear. I'd like for you to take a few minutes,

11 if you haven't already looked at it.

12 We had asked him to appear, but he's

13 applied for a private investigators license, as well as a company. What you are looking at is his 14

experience. You'll see there that you do have the 15

application. This is what the application looks like now as you go out online, everyone is required to go 17

18 online. He's filled this -- there's two applications

19 that he's done online, like I said, private

investigator and one for the company. So if you get 20

past that, you'll see where he's giving information 21

where he was a police officer, and it's just an 22

explanation of what a police officer does. 23

Mr. Kilian? No. So we'll give you a few 24

25 minutes to look at that. He also did enclose his --

Page 32

```
Page 29
   excuse me, include -- it looks like he had his
2
   certifications in firearms, the training that he's
3
   had.
4
           THE COMMISSION: (Commission viewing
5
   document.)
6
           MS. VEST: Remember you are looking at
   the private investigator for the company, and I
   believe it states he had to have 2,000 of compensated
9
   hours with the company for the experience. That's
10 what you are looking at, is his experience. He's
11
    included, looks like, a booking sheet. That is not
12
   his, that is another individual. Took me a minute to
13
    look at that one, too. But he's just showing, I
14
    guess, his writing skills and his evidence.
15
            MR. BAYNE: Arrest and booking report.
16
            MR. FLAIR: Chairman Valentine, I have a
17
    question, if I could. Probably needs --
18
            MS. VEST: Mr. Flair, uh-huh.
19
           MR. FLAIR: Maybe I'm missing it, but
20 where is he employed now? Is it Gallatin PD? I know
21
    that's where he was at one time, and Jackson Florida.
22
    Jacksonville SO, but I am just not seeing where he
    was employed or where he is employed now. Am I
```

24

25

24

missing --

```
1 you information where he apparently had arrested
   somebody, so you can see some of that.
3
          MS. THOMAS: Just for our new Commission
4
   members, the statutory requirement, as far as
5
   experience, is to possess or employ at least one
6
   person who possesses at least 2,000 hours of
7
   compensated verifiable investigative experience
8
   satisfactory to the Commission or has one year of
9
   applicable related experience or education in a
    related area of study approved by the Commission. So
10
    I think that's why he submitted his application to
11
   you all, to see if maybe he fell under the one year
12
13
   of applicable related experience, because he doesn't
    have an employee who has the 2,000 hours experience.
14
15
           MS. VEST: And to answer your question
   about where he works, on the other sheet, it does say
16
17
   that he is self-employed. He is a self-employed
   consultant. He's in Gallatin, worked for a company
18
   called Converse, C-O-N-V-E-R-S-E, out of
19
20
    Massachusetts. He's employed -- then he does give
21
    you employment, number three.
22
           MR. BAYNE: That's on Page 12.
23
           CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: On Page 19 it shows
24
   he was a detective.
25
           MR. ROUSSEAU: On his job description --
```

Page 30 application, when you get to the first sheet? 1 2 MR. FLAIR: Yes, ma'am. 3 MS. VEST: It does ask you for your mailing address, it asks you for your business address. He's in Sumner County. The name of the 5 6 company is Risk Response Group LLC. 7 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: That's his company, 8 isn't it? 9 MS. VEST: Yes. That's what he's 10 applying for. 11 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: But he's not working 12 for that company yet, since he doesn't have a 13 license. 14 MS. VEST: That's right, hopefully. 15 MR. FLAIR: Thank you. 16 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: And he was four 17 years or six years with the Jacksonville Sheriffs Office? 18 19 MR. FLAIR: Four years. 20 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do we know what he did there? 21 22 MS. VEST: No. sir. That's what he 23 supplied to us. That's why I sent him the letter

because I wasn't quite sure. I mean, he was a

policeman, we appreciate that, and then he just gave

MS. VEST: Right on the first of his

I'm assuming this was a sergeant grade. It states 2 his job description --3 MR. BAYNE: What page are you on, Alan? MR. ROUSSEAU: It's one of two from the 4 5 City of Jacksonville. 6 MR. BAYNE: Okay. 7 MR. ROUSSEAU: It gives example of his 8 work experience, knowledge, and skill abilities. So 9 he was employed four years there, so that would meet 10 the hour credentials. 11 MR. BAYNE: Yep, four years is well in 12 excess of 2,000. MS. VEST: If we are not able to make a 13 decision, we can hold it and I can tell him he needs 14 15 to appear at the next Board meeting. He did get a letter telling him to appear. Well, it was dated 16 December the 20th of 2017. "After reviewing your 17 18 application, Private Investigators request you appear before the Tennessee Private Investigation and 19 Polygraph Commission prior to approval of your 20 application." 21 22 MR. BAYNE: Yes, that's on Page 3. 23 MS. VEST: So we did notify him. If you 24 don't have enough information, you want him to

appear, I can send him another letter and hold his

Page 33 Page 35 1 1 applications. MR. BAYNE: That's a good question. 2 MR. SHANKS: So the question is, you all 2 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: How much time does 3 are wanting us to decide if the four years in Florida 3 he have to --4 plus --4 MS. VEST: He has six months. 5 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Six months. Okav. MS. VEST: Is his experience. 5 6 MR. SHANKS: -- is enough experience. 6 So our next meeting is in March, and that would be 7 MS. VEST: I know it's enough experience, 7 four months. Okay. but is it in the right field. I was told to bring 8 MS. VEST: So I think what -- the law enforcement back so you can take a look at that. 9 discussion is to perhaps hold his application until 10 Because not all law enforcement officers, what I 10 our next meeting, send him another letter asking for 11 understand, do the same thing. So you are looking 11 an appearance, and we'll make whatever decision we 12 for somebody who can do investigations. I am aware 12 need to make at the March meeting; is that what I am 13 of -- I am told all the time by law enforcement, I 13 hearing? 14 stopped your car, I have to get your driver's 14 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: That was the motion 15 license, go back to my car, and I have to do an 15 and seconded. investigation. That's not necessarily investigations MR. BAYNE: That is correct. 16 17 for a private investigator, in my opinion, that's why 17 MS. VEST: Thank you. 18 I bring those to you. 18 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: I'll call for a 19 MR. BAYNE: Mr. Chairman, I like the idea 19 vote. All in favor? 20 that this letter dated December 20th from the 20 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 21 Commission to Mr. Kilian, requested Mr. Kilian to 21 MR. VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 22 appear. Mr. Kilian is not here. This letter 22 carries. 23 23 suggests -- requested to appear before the Commission MS. VEST: Now, we do have -- we are prior to approval of an application. And since 24 going to have another appearance. A gentleman's come 25 Mr. Kilian is not here, one would think we send him in, whose last name is L-E-E-T-H, Mr. Earnest Leeth. Page 34 another letter and ask for his appearance. 1 Is that how you pronounce it? You want to come up 2 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Can you put that in there and sit down and go there and talk into the 3 the form of a motion? 3 microphone. MR. BAYNE: I move we hold on approval of 4 4 This is just a little unusual. This 5 Mr. Kilian's application pending his appearance 5 gentleman has come in to appear before the Board before this Commission. 6 because he held a license for a private investigator 7 MS. BREWER: I second. 7 that expired on 3/31/2015, I believe he moved to 8 MR. ROUSSEAU: I have a question, Madam 8 another state. He's come in to talk to you about 9 Chairman (sic). 9 making application again. 10 MS. VEST: Okay. That's what we need to 10 MR. BAYNE: And this is not on the 11 do, Mr. Chairman, we need to -- you need to accept 11 agenda, right? the vote and then we need to open it up for 12 12 MS. VEST: No. sir. It's under 13 discussion. 13 appearances, you don't have it on your --14 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay. Seconded. 14 MS. THOMAS: There's no copy. 15 MS. VEST: By Ms. Brewer? 15 MS. VEST: There's nothing for you to 16 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: By Ms. Brewer. 16 read. 17 MS. VEST: And open for discussion now. MR. BAYNE: Thank you. Your name, again, 17 18 Mr. Rousseau? 18 sir? 19 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Yes. Mr. Rousseau? 19 MR. LEETH: Earnest Craig Leeth, 20 20 L-E-E-T-H. MR. ROUSSEAU: Mr. Chairman, Madam 21 Director, there is a time period for the application. 21 MS. VEST: Okay. He wants to make 22 application, if I'm saying this correctly, to be a 22 Has he exceeded his time period for pending? 23 MS. VEST: That was December and this is private investigator again and to have his own 23 24 just January, no, sir, he has not. company; he wants to open that. He has some

25 extenuating circumstances he wants to talk to you

25

MR. ROUSSEAU: Thank you.

Page 37

1 about.

2

4

6

7

As far as his private investigator, you 3 don't have to take the exam within two years of applying again. He expired on March the 31st, 2015, be '16, be '17, see, I'm already in '18, so he's passed that timeframe. So I'm going to give Mr. Leeth --

8 MR. LEETH: Do I need to turn this on? 9 MS. VEST: Talk right into it. 10

MR. LEETH: Okay. Little bit about me. 11 I worked for Madison County Sheriffs Department in 12 Huntsville, Alabama, in the '80s. I left the 13 Sheriffs Department, was a private investigator in 14 Huntsville throughout the '80s and into the '90s. My 15 first wife passed away in 1999. I married a few 16 years later, moved to Tennessee. I got my private

17 investigator license here in Tennessee. 18 I was working for other companies, and we 19 moved to south Mississippi in 2015. I have done 20 obtained my license in south Mississippi for the two 21 years we were down there. I moved back here. I've 22 got a hot-shot rig, it's a truck, out on the road and 23 had a driver in it. I've chose to drive it and to pay for my truck. My wife's got epilepsy and she had 24 25 a seizure a few weeks ago when I wasn't here and I

1 authority in this case would be to allow him to renew so that he may not have to take the exam again. But if you don't allow for that, I think that's about the 4 only leeway you all can give him. 5 MR. FLAIR: Mr. Chairman, I've got a

6 question. On any of the previous licenses that you 7 have obtained and held in Mississippi, Tennessee, and 8 I think North Carolina, was it?

9 MR. LEETH: No, it was Alabama. The 10 1980s and then through the '90s.

11 MR. FLAIR: Alabama, I'm sorry. Was any of the circumstances unfavorable when you gave your 12 13 license up.

14 MR. LEETH: No, sir. No, sir. 15 MR. FLAIR: Have you ever been

16 reprimanded or --17 MR. LEETH: Never.

MR. FLAIR: From any of those boards of 18 19 any of those three states?

20 MR. LEETH: Never.

21 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Never had any

22 complaints filed against you?

23 MR. LEETH: No, sir.

24 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I got a question.

You were licensed strictly as a PI previously in

Page 38

need to be at home.

1

18

19

2 And I know this is unusual, but I need my 3 private investigator license back. I would like to 4 work for myself as a company and do the best I can in trying to make a living. I know we got rules and 6 regulations and it's unusual, and I wouldn't be 7 asking this if it wasn't for hardship about my wife and things of that nature, but I need to know the 9 fastest way to get my private investigator license 10 back and to get my business license so I can get a 11 few jobs for myself. So that's all I am asking.

12 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: So you are asking 13 for an exception to the rules to get your PI license 14 now.

15 MR. LEETH: I guess that's what I'm 16 doing. 17

MR. ROUSSEAU: Mr. Chairman, I have a question about the problem. I'm going to address to legal counsel and Executive Director. Do we have the authority to supersede the rule after the two years?

20 21 MS. THOMAS: So it wouldn't necessarily 22 be superseding the rule. So once his license is

23 expired and he's out of grace, typically the law requires him to reapply, take the exam again, and 24

25 prove everything again. I think the extent of your

1 Tennessee, not as a company?

2 MR. LEETH: I'm sorry, what?

3 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: You were licensed 4 previously as an investigator only and not as a

5 company also?

6 MR. LEETH: Yes. I worked for a couple 7 of different companies and --

8 MR. ROUSSEAU: I have another question, 9 Mr. Chairman.

10 MS. VEST: Okay. So let me try to see if 11 I can help just a little bit. What we are saying --I think we are saying is, his license expired in '15, 12

and you have the authority to tell me I can renew his 13

license, personal license. But he's never held a 14 company license for himself, so he would have to make 15

application, you know, do the fingerprints, then the

background, and he would have to take the exam. That 17 18 is the statute.

MR. LEETH: Yeah, in the two years I was 20 in Mississippi, I had the company license down there.

21 MS. VEST: I don't -- I'm going to have to refer to legal counsel, I don't know if that would 22 23 take the place --

24 MS. THOMAS: No. I think because he would 25 be a new applicant for a company application, he has

19

Page 41

1 to go by the letter of the law. Like I said, I think 2 the only leeway you all can give him, would be on his 3 personal PI license to maybe renew instead of having 4 to reapply.

5 MR. ROUSSEAU: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to 6 make a motion that we allow staff to allow Mr. Leeth 7 to renew his personal PI license.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do I hear a second? MR. FLAIR: I'll second.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Motion and seconded.

11 MS. VEST: Can I -- before we say that, 12 sir, do you understand what they are saying?

13 MR. LEETH: Yeah, just for my private --14 just for the private investigator license, not the 15 company license.

16 MS. VEST: Right. You would need to find 17 a private investigator company to put your license in for me to issue it. 18

19 MR. LEETH: What would I have to do to 20 get my company license?

21 MS. VEST: Well, you are going to have to 22 make application, pay the fee, do the background, and 23 you will have to take a test.

24 MR. LEETH: Okav.

8

9

10

8

17

25 MS. VEST: It will not be -- I don't 1 MR. LEETH: Well, I was hoping by having 2 a company in Mississippi, that I wouldn't have to do 3 that.

4 MS. VEST: See, that's why he's here. 5 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: I think legal

6 counsel would tell us that the company in Mississippi 7 does not transfer to Tennessee.

8 MR. LEETH: Imaginary state lines, I 9 guess.

10 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: I'll give you an 11 example. I was not an LLC when I first formed my business, and when I formed the LLC, I had to reapply 12 again myself. I didn't have to take the test, I had 13 already taken it, but I had to do the re-filing. It's just what we require. 15

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Any further 16 17 discussion?

18 MR. BAYNE: Well, if I am understanding 19 correctly. I am hearing a motion is on the floor to reinstate Mr. Leeth's personal PI license. I am also 21 hearing that the due process and legal process is 22 somewhat constricted and prevents everything, I 23 think, you are looking for this morning. But the

24 Commission, I suspect, is not immune to the need to

25 help you within the rules. So I think that's why the

Page 42

think it would be very quick. I mean, you could 2 schedule the exam today, but it might be next week. 3 two weeks, or whatever, yes, sir.

4 MR. LEETH: These companies that I worked 5 for when I was a private investigator before here in 6 Tennessee, I imagine they are still in business, I 7 know one's been wanting me back.

MS. VEST: Okay. I am just telling you, 9 if I do approve the private investigator license, I 10 have to have him affiliated with a company in order 11 to approve it. So you would have to find someone to 12 put your license under until you took the exam for 13 the private investigator company.

14 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: When you had a 15 Mississippi license, did you have continuing 16 education hours?

MR. LEETH: No.

18 MS. VEST: Sir, is this going to be any 19 help to you to get your private investigator license 20 back and you are going to find a company to put it 21 with?

22 MR. LEETH: I guess.

23 MS. VEST: And then take the exam -- make 24 the application online and go ahead and take your 25 company exam.

1 motion is on the floor, which I would second, unless

-- I think someone's already seconded it. 2 MR. LEETH: If it wasn't for hardship and 3

my wife having epilepsy, I wouldn't ask for nothing, 4

5 I'd just -- whatever I needed to do. But I have got

a hardship case, and I have got to take care of me 7 and my wife.

8 MR. BAYNE: And I think that the

Commission is sensitive to that plight. I also think

that the path forward would be to find that company 10

11 with whom you have worked before, let them know your

license is renewed, if it's approved, and it's time 12

13 to move forward.

14 MR. LEETH: Now how long would I need to 15 work for another company before I could obtain my 16 business license?

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: You can apply for 17 your business license now. And as soon as it comes 18 19 through, then you can stop working for the other 20 company and work for yourself. 21

MR. LEETH: Reasonable time limit that I need to --

23 MS. THOMAS: That's right.

24 MR. LEETH: Okay.

25 MR. FLAIR: That calls for a decision,

22

```
Page 45
```

1 Mr. Chairman, on the motion.

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: We have heard the motion and second and discussion. All in favor?

4 THE COMMISSION: Aye.

5 MR. VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 6 carries.

7 MS. VEST: All right. So let me make sure I understand, sir. We are going to renew -allow you to renew your private investigators

10 license. I cannot issue it to you until you get me a 11 letter of affiliation from a private investigator

12 company. So it's going to be essential that you get with another company. 13

MR. LEETH: Okav.

15 MS. VEST: All right. And then at any

time between that, you can make application to be a private investigation company yourself.

17 18

MR. LEETH: I'm pretty sure either one of 19 the two that I've worked for -- they have been 20 wanting me back anyhow.

21 MS. VEST: Okay.

22 MR. LEETH: You are going to hold onto my

23 old --

3

4

5

9

10

14

15

16

2

3

14

24 MS. VEST: No, sir. I am going to

25 actually give this back to you. I am going to need

1 thing on the agenda would probably be my

2 administrative matters. You have your iPads, you

have your monthly reports. You should have

4 September, October, November, and December. So I'll

flip over to yours, because this has all the

professions that we have. We'll get to the Private

Investigation Commission. And Mr. Rousseau, we do

appreciate your service. Even though you expired in

9 2014, you're still on our Commission. Thank you so 10 much.

11 MR. ROUSSEAU: Thank you.

12 MS. VEST: Of course, we do now have

Stuart Bayne, whose term expires on 9/30/2021; Robin 13

14 Brewer-Johnston, hers also expires 9/30/2021; and

15 Mr. Douglas Shanks also expires on 9/30/2021.

16 MR. BAYNE: Although going by current experience with Mr. Rousseau, that 2021 appears in 17

question; does it not? 18

19 MS. VEST: It most certainly could.

20 These appointments are made by the governor's office,

21 and we do appreciate your serving as long as

necessary, until you get your papers that thank you 22

23 for your service.

24 MR. ROUSSEAU: I don't get a gold watch

25 or --

to contact you because there's some things I am going 2 to have to do.

MR. LEETH: Now, my address on there, if it's on there, I don't know if it's on there or not. it's a different address and phone number.

6 MS. VEST: No, it's not. How about 7 giving me your telephone number and I'll call --8

MR. LEETH: It's (931)334-3095. MS. VEST: So it's (931)334-3095.

MR. LEETH: Yes, ma'am.

11 MS. VEST: Because I'll need to give you 12 some instruction. All right. Thank you, sir, very

13 much.

MR. LEETH: Thank you all very much.

THE COMMISSION: You're welcome.

MS. VEST: That's all I have,

17 Mr. Valentine, under appearances. You want to take

maybe just a five-, ten-minute break? 18

19 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay. We'll take a 20 five-minute break.

21 (Short break.)

MR. VALENTINE: This is Walt Valentine, 22

23 Chairman. We are calling the Commission back into

24 order.

25

MS. VEST: All right. I think the next

Page 48 MS. VEST: I can give you something. I 1 2 can find an old piece of watch somewhere, if you want 3 to. Might not have a strap.

4 All of them are going to stay the same 5 for those months. We didn't have anything under monthly reports that was different, it's all the 6

7 same.

8 So we'll move right into a different topic, which is your budget review, and I need to 9

talk to you about this. Okay. Now, all you have is

July, August, September, October, and November. 11 don't have any December figures at all for you. If 12

13 you will notice, you are in the negative of \$9,215.

14 It looks like we are taking an ebb there, which is

15 something unusual for the PI program.

16 In November we were in the negative; 17 August, positive; September, negative; October,

positive: November, negative. It's -- we have 18

19 anticipated it will take care of itself as it goes

20 through the year. I am not anticipating any

21 problems. I will look at it real close when we hit

that February and March totals, make sure we are 22

23 going to be in a positive.

24 You do know, for our new members, our

25 fiscal year starts July the 1st and ends June the

Page 52

30th. The Commissions must, as they start over their new fiscal year -- and we do it starting in July, you 3 must be self-sufficient.

4 There are some expenditures on there. 5 Addison expenditures, that's our new computer system. You have some cost backs, but they look like they are all staying within the same range. Legal cost backs 8 are staying within the same range. I don't see anything that's standing out that's making this a 10 negative. Investigations, we did a few more than the last month. And customer service, it looks like it's 11 12 pretty even there.

13 I think our big month for renewals for 14 private investigators are right, like, in March and 15 April, is when we actually started the program years 16 ago. So you are going to have more that are just going to come in. But I will watch this for you, and 18 if I do see the trend, I'll be talking with Bill 19 Huddleston and watching this rather closely. We 20 should be able to make up this negative \$9.215 21 without a problem there.

22 Just for the new Board members, if we do 23 not, we will have to go to the Hill and explain why 24 we didn't, or we may have to take a look at raising 25 fees, which we talked about years -- what, three or

THE COMMISSION: (Commission viewing 1 2 document.)

3 MS. VEST: Now, all I'm seeing is that she has passed the private investigation company

5 exam. We don't find any computer information where

6 she passed the other exam for private investigator,

7 but we'll contact her and find out if she has.

8 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: And she has the number of hours that are required?

9 10 MS. VEST: That's what we are looking at, 11 is her experience. According to the letters -- of

12 course, now, she's got the transcript for you to look 13 at as well. Looks like United States Department of

Agriculture. It doesn't tell me exactly how long --

it's just a letter -- to me, a letter of

recommendation. She's highly recommended. They have

known her since 1985. She's worked with the Finance 17

Administration Department at the Town of Oakland for 18 19

two years. They have recommended her. And she's 20 passed the exam.

21 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: She's not applied 22 for PI license?

23 MS. VEST: Yes, she's applying for both 24 of them. But all I have on record is that she passed

the company exam. She may have not taken it yet, the

four years ago, but we started levelling off. As long as we are maintaining a balance, even though we 3 might have a reserve, we don't use -- we don't use 4 the reserve, we have to be able to maintain at all times from July to June. But I will help you with 6 that. 7

Okay. The next thing I believe we have is an application review. This individual under application review should be Exhibit A. You are 10 going to see the same thing you did for this other 11 gentleman. You have the application there, that's 12 what it looks like now that they make it online. 13 She's answering all these questions as well. She has 14 some real estate experience here.

15 She's the same as the other gentleman, 16 she's making application to be a private investigator 17 and a private investigation company. I was looking 18 to see what page it was. It does tell you -- it does 19 have where she's -- or employment, that's what you 20 were looking for before, her employment, past 21 employment is second place, third, and the fourth,

22 says she was -- I think it starts with Page 8. You

23 have the transcript from the University of Tennessee.

24 You have some letters of recommendation that's --

25 that is also included.

9

individual, or I might not have the report yet.

2 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: What's her

3 investigative experience?

4 MS. VEST: I didn't see any. That's why

5 I brought it to you, because she has her education here. Okay. We do have that she passed the private

7 investigation exam and she did pass the company exam.

So she has done that. I was looking at the

9 University of Tennessee so I could determine what her

major -- it looks like her major is computer 10

11 accounting technology.

12 MS. THOMAS: And again, I think that this application -- because she doesn't have the 14 2,000 hours of investigative experience, I think it 15 appears that this particular applicant is going under these -- or trying to go under the "Has one year of

16 applicable related experience or education in a 17

18 related field of study approved by the Commission."

19 MR. BAYNE: Page 11 shows the official 20 student transcript.

MS. VEST: Right, here she has --21

22 MR. BAYNE: Quite extensive.

23 MS. VEST: She has Baker University,

Bachelor of Business Administration. Might help you 24

just a little bit here. She went to Southwest Tech

Page 53 Page 55 didn't see that either. -- Tennessee College. 1 2 2 MR. SHANKS: Could we have her come here MR. ROUSSEAU: She has business law 3 credits. 3 and speak with us? 4 4 MS. VEST: Most certainly, Mr. Shanks, MS. VEST: University of Tennessee. 5 student public service. Professional experience, 5 you can require her to come in. MR. SHANKS: I make a motion -- I guess financial officer/recorder for the Town of Oakland 6 7 we hold this off until she makes an appearance and we 7 from April of 2013 to April of 2015, General 8 can ask her questions about her investigative skills 8 Administration and Financial Department. She was 9 and knowledge. also a city administrator for the City of Galloway 10 from January 2009 to November 2012. She's also an 10 MR. ROUSSEAU: Second. 11 assistant broker. 11 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Discussion? I had 12 one question. You mentioned a bachelors degree from 12 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Mr. Chairman, I Baker College or University? 13 need to recuse myself from this one. 13 MS. VEST: Yes, sir. 14 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay. 14 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: And that was in 15 15 MS. VEST: Okay. Then we need to ask you business administration. 16 16 to step out in the hall, Mr. Brown, please. 17 17 MS. VEST: Yes, sir, it's a business VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Sure. administration also. 18 (WHEREUPON, Mr. Brown recused himself to 18 19 the hall.) 19 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Okay. Any further 20 discussion? 20 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: I don't see under 21 MS. VEST: So I believe the motion was to 21 the University of Tennessee that municipal technical 22 advisory service a bachelors degree indication there 22 ask her to appear -- hold off on her approval of her 23 23 license and ask her to appear at the next meeting. anywhere. 24 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Yes, that's the 24 MR. BAYNE: Are you looking on Page 11, 25 motion. All in favor? 25 Walt? Page 56 Page 54 1 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: I see the 1 THE COMMISSION: Aye. transcript, but it doesn't show that she was awarded 2 2 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion a bachelors degree. 3 3 carries. 4 MR. BAYNE: M-task courses, I think, are 4 MS. VEST: Hold on just a minute, make 5 the short courses, seminar courses, half day, full sure I get this all down here. The next thing, I 5 6 day, not -- I don't think they are baccalaureate 6 believe -- I'm sorry, Mr. Chair, I'm jumping right in 7 program courses. I don't know. in front of you, I'm sorry -- is the Education 7 8 MS. THOMAS: Mr. Chairman, I will say the Committee, education review. The Education Committee 8 9 information Cody was reading from was from the met this morning. And first I'd like to tell you 9 10 applicant's resume where she said there was a it's Alan, Larry, and David. We would like to have 10 Bachelor Degree in Business Administration. 11 two more members on the Committee --11 12 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Does that qualify as 12 MR. BAYNE: I would volunteer. 13 education for the PI license? 13 MS. VEST: -- to volunteer. Okay, we 14 MS. THOMAS: I think that's the question have a volunteer for Stuart. Any other volunteer? 14 for the Commission. It has to be approved by the CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: I'll volunteer also. 15 15 16 Commission as a related field of study. 16 MS. VEST: Mr. Valentine. Walt. That will give us five people on the Committee from now on 17 MR. BAYNE: Do you see anything that 17 might -- she was 20 years with the USDA and letters 18 to review. 18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

there's discussion.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

related work.

see anything either.

of recommendation suggest highly qualified, but I

CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Exactly. I didn't

MS. BREWER: I am searching to try to --

MS. VEST: We looked at the resume and

hadn't seen anything that says X investigative

We reviewed all the courses, and the

MR. FLAIR: I'll make a motion that we

Committee, like I said, there were three of them,

approved all three courses to be approved. I'd like

to have that in a form of a motion, please, unless

they had voted all three courses -- or they had

Page 57 Page 59 1 accept the Committee's recommendation. Larry Flair. 1 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Any discussion? All 2 MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks, second. in favor? 2 3 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Any discussion? All 3 THE COMMISSION: Aye. 4 in favor? MR. VALENTINE: All opposed? Good luck. THE COMMISSION: Aye. 5 (WHEREUPON, the meeting was adjourned at 6 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: All opposed? Motion 6 11:01 a.m.) 7 carries. 7 8 MS. VEST: As far as unfinished business, 8 9 I don't have any unfinished business there 9 Mr. Valentine. And right now I don't have any new 10 10 11 business, and I don't know of anybody who signed up. 11 12 Mr. Rousseau may have a statement. 12 13 MR. ROUSSEAU: Mr. Chairman? 13 14 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Yes. 14 15 MR. ROUSSEAU: I don't know if this is 15 16 appropriate or -- I don't think we have done this 16 before, but as we all know that Dr. Ritch, throughout 17 17 18 the illness of his son and wife, was here for a long 18 19 time. He was very dedicated. He was very proud of 19 20 the fact that he only missed about two or three 20 meetings. And is it appropriate -- is it within the 21 22 rules for us to send a letter to him, as the 22 23 Commission, thanking him? 23 24 MS. VEST: He will get a plaque. We have 24 25 already gotten together. We are going to have to 25 Page 58 Page 60 contact Dr. Ritch, make sure our years are the same. 1 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 2 Minnie Lane also is to get her plaque, and there - I 3 STATE OF TENNESSEE believe there are a couple others we are trying to COUNTY OF SUMNER 4 order the plaques for. Yes. And it will have a 5 I, JENNY CHECUGA, Licensed Court Reporter, with offices in Nashville, Tennessee, and Registered 5 letter that accompanies it thanking them for their 6 Professional Reporter, hereby certify that I reported 8 the foregoing Commission Meeting by machine shorthand 7 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Do we mail that to 9 to the best of my skills and abilities, and 8 them or can they come here? 10 thereafter the same was reduced to typewritten form 11 by me. 9 MS. VEST: If they can come here, we will I further certify that I am not related to 12 10 ask them to come here so we can present the plaque any of the parties named herein, nor their counsel, 13 11 and get the photos also of them. We'd like to have 14 and have no interest, financial or otherwise, in the 12 that as public record as well. If they are not able 15 outcome of the proceedings. I further certify that in order for this 16 13 to attend, of course we will mail it to them. document to be considered a true and correct copy, it MR. ROUSSEAU: Thank you. 14 17 must bear my original signature and that any 15 MS. VEST: Thank you, Mr. Rousseau. unauthorized reproduction in whole or in part and/or 18 transfer of this document is not authorized, will not 16 CHAIRMAN VALENTINE: Do we have any be considered authentic, and will be in violation of 17 continuing education participation? Tennessee Code Annotated 39-14-104, Theft of 19 18 MS. VEST: No, we do not, that I'm aware Services. 19 of. 20 21 20 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: Are we at that 22 time? 21 CHECUGA, LCR, RPR 22 MS. VEST: We are at that time. 23 Elite Reporting Services Licensed Court Reporter (TN) 23 VICE-CHAIRMAN BROWN: We are at that 24 Notary Public State of Tennessee 24 time. I make a motion we adjourn. My Notary Commission Expires: 5/22/2019 25 25 MR. SHANKS: Doug Shanks, second. LCR #690 - Expires: 6/30/2018

2016070531 23:3 24:7 administrator 53:9 \$ 8 2016070571 24:10 admits 20:11 2017 5:21 13:8,15 14:18 adopt 5:11,13 6:1 \$1,000 22:6 8 23:16 50:22 15:16 32:17 advertising 21:8 **\$4,000** 13:10 80s 37:12.14 2017061811 12:22 advisory 53:22 **\$500** 15:8.11 19:15 24:8 2017061831 12:21 9 affair 17:14 **\$9,215** 48:13 49:20 2017063421 18:13 affiliated 42:10 9/30/2021 47:13,14,15 2017063441 15:5 1 affiliation 45:11 90 13:17 2017063461 15:4 17:12 affirmatively 26:15 1 15:6 23:10,11 90s 37:14 39:10 2017072841 17:11 agency's 23:14 10 13:8 14:18 931 334-3095 46:8,9 2017072891 17:11 agenda 5:8,10,11,13 102017 14:8 9:31 4:5 2017075461 20:1 6:11,14 27:15 36:11 47:1 11 15:16 52:19 53:24 2018 4:4 agent 23:18,22 Α **1175-04-.06(4)** 14:13 2021 47:17 agree 7:3 16:17 abilities 32:8 204 21:16 agreement 14:3 20:9 12 31:22 absent 6:16 20th 32:17 33:20 Agriculture 51:14 15 40:12 Absolutely 27:14 ahead 6:18 7:2,7 9:4 21 23:16 16 37:5 17:8 27:18 42:24 abusive 17:19 22 5:21 17 37:5 accept 12:11 14:21 Alabama 37:12 39:9,11 24 16:11 18 37:5 16:24 17:24 20:16 22:17 Alan 4:24 5:16 8:3 9:23 26th 4:4 26:7 34:11 19 31:23 10:20 12:14 32:3 access 21:12 1980s 39:10 allegation 20:6 3 acclimation 9:20 10:23 1985 51:17 allegations 23:11 accounting 52:11 3 32:22 1999 37:15 alleged 21:5,14 acknowledged 14:7 3/31/2015 36:7 1st 48:25 alleges 17:13 20:2 23:5 **acting** 21:16 30 13:17 alleging 12:23 15:5 2 activity 19:17 20:2 22:7, 18:14 30th 49:1 15 23:4 24:10 25:17,19, allowed 22:14 31st 37:4 2 15:7,10,12,14 17:20,21 23 allowing 20:9 acts 18:22 2,000 29:8 31:6,14 32:12 4 America's 21:6 52:14 Addison 49:5 amicable 24:20 2009 53:10 48 16:11 additional 13:20 amount 14:15 19:15 2011 18:25 Additionally 25:7 22:6 6 2012 53:10 address 13:25 15:19 and/or 19:3 2013 20:7 23:9 25:19 16:2 24:15,16 30:4,5 6.67 15:11 Annotated 19:16 21:15 38:18 46:3,5 53:7 62-26-202 21:16 answering 50:13 addresses 13:19 24:15 2014 47:9 62-26-204(a) 19:16 anticipated 48:19 2014024061 21:3 Administration 51:18 52:24 53:8 62-6-204(8) 24:9 anticipating 48:20 2015 20:13 37:4,19 53:7 administrative 47:2 apparently 24:19 31:1 2016 23:16 25:20

appearance 27:16 34:1, 5 35:11,24

**appearances** 36:13 46:17

appeared 21:25

**appears** 16:6 19:6 47:17 52:15

**applicable** 31:9,13 52:17

applicant 40:25 52:15

**application** 28:16 30:1 31:11 32:18,21 33:24 34:5,21 35:9 36:9,22 40:16,25 41:22 42:24 45:16 50:8,9,11,16 52:13

**applications** 27:23 28:18 33:1

applied 28:13 51:21

apply 25:3 44:17

**applying** 30:10 37:4 51:23

appointments 47:20

approval 5:8,20 32:20 33:24 34:4

**approve** 18:7 19:2,19 42:9,11

approved 18:23 31:10 44:12 52:18

approximately 4:5

April 49:15 53:7

area 31:10

Arm 8:24

Arrest 29:15

arrested 31:1

**Ashley** 27:1,4,11

asks 30:4

asset 13:14 18:23

assistant 27:4 53:11

assists 18:17 27:5

assuming 32:1

attempts 14:5

attorney 19:1,10,12

attorneys 21:25 22:2

**August** 13:8 14:8,18 15:16 48:11,17

**authority** 38:20 39:1 40:13

authorized 19:13 22:5 authorized 24:9

aware 28:7 33:12

**aye** 5:18 6:9 11:6 12:16 14:25 15:1 17:3 18:8,9 19:23 20:22,23 22:21,22 26:18,19 35:20 45:4

В

Bachelor 52:24

bachelors 53:22

back 9:17 33:9,15 37:21 38:3,10 42:7,20 45:20,25 46:23

background 21:9 40:17 41:22

backs 49:6,7

bail 23:14,17,22

**Baker** 52:23

balance 50:2

**basis** 14:2

Bayne 4:14,15 6:2,4,21, 23 7:4,19,21 9:24,25 10:1,15,18,20 19:19 24:25 25:6 27:13 29:15 31:22 32:3,6,11,22 33:19 34:4 35:1,16 36:10,17 43:18 44:8 47:13,16 52:19,22 53:24

began 22:11

begin 12:20

**behalf** 19:12

belongs 17:7

big 49:13

bigger 26:3

Bill 49:18

**bit** 11:14,17 12:7 37:10 40:11 52:25

block 19:9

**Board** 20:14 32:15 36:5 49:22

Board's 25:8

**boards** 39:18

bond 23:14.17

booking 29:11,15

borders 20:10

break 46:18.20.21

**Brewer** 4:20,21 11:3,4 16:20,21,23 17:25 22:19 34:7,15,16

Brewer-johnston 47:14

bring 33:8,18

**broker** 53:11

brought 28:9 52:5

Brown 4:2,5,16,17 5:7, 15,19 6:3,6,10 7:3,25 8:2,16,20,21 9:4,8,13 10:14,17 11:8,11,15,17, 25 12:13,15 17:23 20:18, 19 26:6,11 39:24 40:3 42:14 43:10 51:21 53:12, 16.17.18

**Brown's** 8:16

budget 48:9

**business** 23:14,24 30:4 38:10 42:6 43:12 44:16, 18 52:24 53:2

C

C-O-N-V-E-R-S-E 31:19

**call** 4:6 8:9 10:23 14:24 17:2 22:21 26:10 35:18 46:7

**called** 31:19

calling 7:12 46:23

calls 13:22 15:9 44:25

car 33:14,15

care 44:6 48:19

Carolina 10:7 39:8

carried 11:7

**carries** 5:19 6:11 12:17 15:3 17:5 18:11 19:25 20:25 22:24 26:21 35:22 45:6

**case** 12:21 13:9,17 15:4 16:12 17:6 18:12,13 23:2,3 39:1 44:6

cases 17:8 27:2

**cease** 10:3

ceased 11:8

certifications 29:2

certified 24:13

**chair** 7:13 8:10 9:14 10:3,5,8 11:17,18,23 12:8

Chairman 9:5 10:9 11:1, 21 12:3,5,9 14:20,24 15:2 16:19 17:1,4 18:6 19:18,22,24 20:15,20 22:16,20,23 25:16,21 26:1,9,17,20 27:11,15 29:16 30:7,11,16,20 31:23 33:19 34:2,9,11, 14,16,19,20 35:2,5,14,18 38:12,17 39:5,21 40:9 41:5,8,10 43:5,16 44:17 45:1,2 46:19,23 51:8 52:2 53:12.14,20

change 12:7

changed 12:6

charges 24:8

checks 21:9

**chose** 37:23

circumstances 36:25 39:12

city 32:5 53:9

civil 19:14 22:6 24:8

claiming 23:17

claims 19:3 24:5

client 19:9

**close** 14:14 17:22 20:14 22:14 24:24 48:21

closed 24:11

closely 49:19

closing 25:10

Code 19:16 21:15

Cody 4:8 6:12

College 53:1

commission 4:3,5,8,11, 13 5:9,18,24 6:9,16,20, 22 7:13 8:10 9:2,13 10:6 11:6,25 12:1,8,16 15:1 17:3 18:9 19:23 20:23 21:2,18 22:7,22 25:5 26:19 27:8,10 29:4 31:3, 8,10 32:20 33:21,23 34:6 35:20 43:24 44:9 45:4 46:15,23 47:7,9 51:1 52:18

Commission's 12:19 24:11

Commissioner 6:4,6 10:13 20:19 26:6

Commissioners 5:23

Commissions 49:1

Committee 5:22

communicated 17:21

communication 14:19 15:18 16:3

companies 28:3 37:18 40:7 42:4

company 14:1 18:22 19:8,11 21:17 23:7,10, 17,19,21,23 24:1,3,17,21 28:14,20 29:7,9 30:6,7, 12 31:18 36:24 38:4 40:1,5,15,20,25 41:15, 17,20 42:10,13,20,25 43:2,6 44:10,15,20 45:12,13,17 50:17 51:4, 25 52:7

company's 23:8

compensated 29:8 31:7

Complainant 13:2,4,7, 9,12,16,18,24 14:1,6,7, 16 15:7,9,10,11,15,18, 20,21,24 16:1,3,6,10 17:13,18,19 18:16,19 20:2,6 23:5,9,14,19,24

Complainant's 23:24 24:2

complaint 12:23 13:24 15:5,19 18:14 19:6 21:5, 14 23:4,11 25:8,14

complaints 23:9 39:22

complete 13:17

completed 14:3

completion 16:12

complicated 11:21

complied 16:13

Comprehensive 14:12 16:17

computer 49:5 51:5 52:10

concern 14:10

concurred 22:7 24:12

conduct 13:13

conducted 15:13

conducting 21:8

confirmed 15:14

Congratulations 10:4 11:8,22 12:2

consent 19:14 22:5 24:14

constricted 43:22

consultant 31:18

consumer 23:3

contact 14:15 24:20 46:1 51:7

**contacted** 13:7 14:8 22:1

contingency 19:8

continues 17:19

continuing 42:15

contract 12:24 16:4,9,14 19:5,6

contracting 13:4

contracts 18:20 19:2

contractual 23:20

Converse 31:19

copy 5:10,25 16:4 36:14

correct 16:1 35:16

correctly 36:22 43:19

cost 49:6,7

**counsel** 17:7 18:7 20:17 22:13,18 26:23 27:4 38:19 40:22 43:6

Counsel's 14:22 17:24 26:7

County 30:5 37:11

couple 21:1 40:6

**court** 13:1

Craig 36:19

credentials 32:10

credits 53:3

criminal 20:5

cross 20:10

current 21:19 47:16

customer 49:11

D

dated 32:16 33:20

**David** 4:5,16 8:16,20,21 9:13 10:16 11:25 12:15

day-to-day 27:5

days 13:17 16:12

**December** 32:17 33:20 34:23 47:4 48:12

decide 25:12.24 33:3

decision 24:11 32:14 35:11 44:25

**degree** 53:22

denies 24:3

Department 24:18

37:11,13 51:13,18 53:8

**description** 31:25 32:2

detective 31:24

determine 52:9

developed 13:20

director 6:12 27:25 34:21 38:19

disciplinary 17:7 22:13

discipline 25:9

discoveries 13:20

discussion 5:17 6:7,25 27:22 34:13,17 35:9 43:17 45:3

dispute 23:20

disputes 14:7

divided 27:3

**Division** 18:24 19:4 22:11

divorced 17:16

document 29:5 51:2

double 23:18

**Doug** 5:3,12,15 8:4 16:25 26:8

**Douglas** 4:12 47:15

drive 37:23

driver 37:23

driver's 33:14

due 43:21

duty 6:17

E

earn 15:23

Earnest 35:25 36:19

ebb 48:14

education 5:22 31:9 42:16 52:5.17

**elect** 12:10

**election** 6:15 7:8 9:20 11:8

employ 31:5

employed 24:18 29:20, 23 31:20 32:9

**employee** 23:13 31:14

**employees** 23:6 24:2

employment 23:15 31:21 50:19,20,21

enclose 28:25

ends 48:25

enforce 13:1

**enforcement** 21:13 23:22 27:22,24 28:2,5,7 33:9,10,13

engaged 23:19

entered 12:24

enters 18:19

entitled 15:11

epilepsy 37:24 44:4

essential 45:12

**estate** 50:14

**evidence** 14:10,14 16:13 29:14

**exam** 37:3 38:24 39:2 40:17 42:2,12,23,25 51:5,6,20,25 52:7

exceeded 34:22

exception 38:13

**excess** 32:12

exclusive 14:2

excuse 10:10 16:2 29:1

**Executive** 6:12 38:19

Exhibit 50:9

expenditures 49:4,5

expenses 14:17

**experience** 28:15 29:9, 10 31:5,7,9,13,14 32:8 33:5,6,7 47:17 50:14 51:11 52:3,14,17 53:5

**expired** 25:11 36:7 37:4 38:23 40:12 47:8

expires 47:13,14,15

explain 49:23

explanation 28:23

extensive 52:22

**extent** 38:25

extenuating 36:25

F

**fact** 14:6 **failed** 15:8

fastest 38:9

**favor** 5:17 6:8 11:5 12:15 14:25 17:2 18:7 19:22 20:21 22:21 26:17 35:19 45:3

February 4:4 48:22

federal 20:4

fee 21:22 41:22

feel 6:25

fees 49:25

fell 31:12

fellow 4:3

female 15:13

field 33:8 52:18

**figures** 48:12

file 24:23

filed 23:9 39:22

filled 28:18

Finance 51:17

financial 53:6,8

find 41:16 42:11,20 44:10 48:2 51:5,7

fine 7:1,4,10

fingerprints 40:16

firearms 29:2

firm 18:23

fiscal 48:25 49:2

five- 46:18

five-minute 46:20

flag 24:23 25:1,24

Flair 4:18,19 5:16 10:25 11:2 29:16,18,19 30:2, 15,19 39:5,11,15,18 41:9 44:25

flip 47:5

floor 43:19 44:1

Florida 21:20 29:21 33:3

follow-up 14:9

forfeitures 23:25

form 15:20 34:3

formal 19:14 22:5 24:8

formed 43:11,12

forward 44:10,13

found 17:16

fourth 50:21

fraud 20:5

front 8:13 25:4

full 6:20.22

Fund 18:19

funds 19:9

G

Gallatin 29:20 31:18

Galloway 53:9

gave 30:25 39:12

General 27:4 53:7

gentleman 26:24 27:21

36:5 50:11,15

gentleman's 27:19

35:24

gentlemen 11:20,23

12:2

**give** 21:4 28:24 31:20 37:6 39:4 41:2 43:10 45:25 46:11 48:1

giving 28:21 46:7

gold 47:24

good 4:2 35:1

governor's 47:20

grace 38:23

grade 32:1

**Group** 30:6

guess 12:3 29:14 38:15

42:22 43:9

guests 4:4

H

hall 53:16,19

handle 20:11

harassment 20:3

hardship 38:7 44:3,6

head 26:14

hear 14:20 16:19 19:18 20:15 22:16 26:1 41:8

heard 45:2

hearing 19:14 22:5,9 35:13 43:19,21

held 36:6 39:7 40:14

**highly** 51:16

Hill 49:23

hire 14:1

hired 13:13 15:6,25 23:18.21 24:4

hit 48:21

**hold** 32:14,25 34:4 35:9

45:22

home 38:1

honored 4:3

hoping 43:1

hot-shot 37:22

hour 32:10

**hours** 15:12 16:11 29:9 31:6,14 42:16 51:9 52:14

Huddleston 49:19

Huffman 17:8,10 20:1 23:2 25:2,18 26:24 27:7,

Huntsville 37:12,14

husband 17:14,15,17

1

idea 33:19

identified 21:24

illegal 24:3

Imaginary 43:8

imagine 42:6

**immune** 43:24

include 29:1

included 29:11 50:25

Indiana 10:9,10

indication 19:11 53:22

individual 9:19 23:12 29:12 50:8 52:1

individual's 23:8

individuals 8:11 18:20

**information** 13:1,3,5,6 16:2 21:4,11,12,22 24:20 28:21 31:1 32:24 51:5

information's 24:22

informed 13:16 24:17

instruction 46:12

interrupting 26:16

introduce 26:23

investigation 4:7 10:5 11:24 12:1,25 13:15 14:4 20:4,7 21:18 28:7 32:19 33:16 45:17 47:7 50:17 51:4 52:7

investigations 20:9,12 21:17 28:6,8 33:12,16 49:10

investigative 31:7 52:3,

investigator 18:15 21:24 22:2 24:5 25:12 28:20 29:7 33:17 36:6,23 37:2,13,17 38:3,9 40:4 41:14,17 42:5,9,13,19 45:11 50:16 51:6

investigators 15:24 21:7,10,12 28:4,13 32:18 45:9 49:14

**ipads** 47:2

issue 14:11 16:15 26:3 41:18 45:10

**issues** 13:25

item 5:8 6:11

itemized 14:16

J

Jackson 29:21

Jacksonville 29:22 30:17 32:5

January 34:24 53:10

**Jerry** 4:22

job 31:25 32:2

jobs 38:11

Jones 4:22 5:6 6:17

iudaement 13:1

July 48:11,25 49:2 50:5

June 48:25 50:5

K

K-I-L-I-A-N 27:20

K-Y-L-E 27:19

Kentucky 20:8

Kilian 28:24 33:21,22,25

Kilian's 34:5

Killian 27:17

knew 10:10

knowledge 32:8

Kyle 27:19

L

L-E-E-T-H 35:25 36:20

lack 16:3

Larry 4:18 5:16

latest 14:18

laundering 20:6

law 21:13 27:21,24 28:1, 5,7 33:9,10,13 38:23 41:1 53:2

leads 13:20

learn 23:24

**Leeth** 35:25 36:19 37:7, 8,10 38:15 39:9,14,17, 20,23 40:2,6,19 41:6,13, 19,24 42:4,17,22 43:1,8 44:3,14,21,24 45:14,18, 22 46:3,8,10,14

Leeth's 43:20

leeway 39:4 41:2

left 37:12

**legal** 12:18,20 27:2,3,21 38:19 40:22 43:5,21 49:7

**letter** 14:11 16:15 30:23 32:16,25 33:20,22 34:1 35:10 41:1 45:11 51:15

letters 50:24 51:11

levelling 50:1

license 18:16 21:18,19 25:3,11,15,19,24 28:13 30:13 33:15 36:6 37:17, 20 38:3,9,10,13,22 39:13 40:12,14,15,20 41:3,7, 14,15,17,20 42:9,12,15, 19 43:20 44:12,16,18 45:10 51:22

licensed 13:2 19:1 20:3, 13 21:9,11 23:6 24:4 25:13,16,18,25 39:25 40:3

licenses 23:8 39:6

limit 44:21

lines 43:8

listed 15:19

litigation 27:3

living 38:5

LLC 30:6 43:11.12

locate 26:5

located 19:1

locator 18:24 19:2

long 44:14 47:21 50:2 51:14

longer 24:18

looked 28:11

Lookups 21:8

M

Madam 10:25 34:8,20

made 6:2 9:22 12:15 13:21,22 26:12 47:20

Madison 37:11

mail 24:16

mailed 15:15 24:14

mailing 15:17 24:13 30:4 maintain 11:12 50:4 maintaining 50:2

major 52:10

make 7:10 8:22 10:25 16:23 19:19 32:13 35:11, 12 36:21 38:5 40:15 41:6,22 42:23 45:7,16 48:22 49:20 50:12

makes 5:12 9:3

making 36:9 49:9 50:16

March 35:6,12 37:4 48:22 49:14

married 37:15

marry 17:18

Massachusetts 31:20

matter 15:6 22:8,14

matters 47:2

meant 24:25

meet 32:9

meeting 4:6 5:23 6:15, 19 32:15 35:6,10,12

meetings 13:13

member 4:11 5:9,24 6:16 9:2

members 4:3 9:3 31:4 48:24 49:22

message 13:8

messages 16:5

microphone 16:22 36:3

minimal 13:5

**minute** 29:12

minutes 5:20,21,25 6:1 28:10.25

misconduct 14:13 16:18

missing 13:13 29:19,24

**Mississippi** 37:19,20 39:7 40:20 42:15 43:2,6

money 15:23 18:17 20:5

month 49:11,13

monthly 47:3 48:6 months 35:4,5,7 48:5 morning 4:2 43:23

motion 5:11,12,15,19,25 6:3,10 9:22 10:24,25 11:7 12:14,17 14:20 15:2 16:19,20,23 17:4 18:10 19:18,19,24 20:15,24 22:16,23 26:1,12,20 34:3 35:14,21 41:6,10 43:19 44:1 45:1,3,5

Motor 22:11

move 7:7 9:11,21 10:13 11:13,16,19 12:11 14:21 20:16 22:17 26:7 34:4 44:13 48:8

**moved** 17:1 18:6 20:20 22:20 26:9 36:7 37:16, 19.21

multiple 13:21 15:8 26:4 municipal 53:21

### N

named 19:10 names 13:19

nature 38:8

necessarily 33:16 38:21

needed 44:5

negative 48:13,16,17,18 49:10.20

newest 4:11

nodding 26:14

nominate 7:14,24

nominated 7:17 8:16,17 9:18.19

nomination 7:18 9:7,10, 12 10:16 11:5

nominations 7:12,13,23 8:6 10:21,22

nonresidents 22:12

north 10:7,11 39:8

**notice** 48:13

**notify** 32:23

November 23:16 47:4 48:11,16,18 53:10

**number** 12:21 15:4 17:6, 10 18:11,12 20:1 31:21 46:5.7 51:9

#### 0

Oakland 51:18 53:6
obtain 21:21 44:15
obtained 37:20 39:7
obtaining 21:17
occasions 15:13 16:7
October 47:4 48:11,17
offered 21:21
offering 22:11
office 30:18 47:20
officer 28:6,22,23
officer/recorder 53:6
officers 6:15,18 33:10
official 52:19
one's 42:7
ongoing 13:16

online 28:17,18,19 42:24 50:12

open 34:12,17 36:24

opened 12:23 15:5 18:14

operating 18:15

operations 27:5

opinion 33:17

**opposed** 6:10 12:17 15:2 17:4 18:10 19:24 20:24 22:23 26:20 35:21 45:5

**order** 4:6 12:5,6,9,10,12 13:1 19:14 22:5 24:14 42:10 46:24

original 21:4

outstanding 13:25 23:25

owner 23:7

### P

pad 8:12 27:21 paid 13:10 15:11 19:8 papers 8:18 47:22 part 8:6 parties 13:22 party 14:16 19:7 pass 52:7 passed 37:6,15 51:4,6, 20,24 52:6 passing 8:18 past 28:21 50:20 path 44:10 pay 37:24 41:22 payment 18:20 PD 29:20 penalty 19:15 22:6 24:8 pending 34:5,22 people 13:14 18:17 perform 23:23 period 20:12 27:12 34:21,22 person 31:6

person 31:5

personal 40:14 41:3,7 43:20

phone 15:8 46:5

PI 23:6,7 24:6 38:13 39:25 41:3,7 43:20 48:15 51:22

**piece** 48:2

place 20:7 25:17 40:23 50:21

planted 23:18 pleased 26:25

pleasure 11:15 27:14

plight 44:9

point 22:9 25:11

police 28:22,23

policeman 30:25

Polygraph 4:7 10:6 11:24 12:1 32:20

portion 16:14

posed 23:5

positive 48:17,18,23

possess 31:5

possesses 31:6

potential 24:3

practice 25:12

practices 23:25

prefer 8:14

Premier 21:6

present 5:6 6:17 17:8

presentation 21:4

presented 24:6

presenting 27:1

pretty 45:18 49:12

prevents 43:22

**previous** 22:4 24:7,11 39:6

previously 39:25 40:4

prior 13:4 32:20 33:24

private 4:7 8:12 10:5 11:24 12:1,24 18:15 21:7,9,11 24:4 25:12 27:25 28:1,3,13,19 29:7 32:18,19 33:17 36:6,23 37:2,13,16 38:3,9 41:13, 14,17 42:5,9,13,19 45:9, 11,17 47:6 49:14 50:16, 17 51:4,6 52:6

problem 38:18 49:21

problems 48:21

process 43:21

Professional 53:5

professions 47:6

program 48:15 49:15

prohibit 21:16

pronounce 36:1

property 18:18,24 19:4,

Protective 28:1 **prove** 38:25 provide 12:25 13:6.11 16:10 provided 13:3,5,18 14:4, 17 15:20,25 16:4 public 53:5 put 34:2 41:17 42:12,20 Q

question 19:3 24:1,25

29:17 31:15 33:2 34:8

35:1 38:18 39:6,24 40:8

47:18 questioned 23:6 questions 50:13 quick 42:1 auorum 5:6

R

raising 49:24 range 49:7,8 re-filing 43:14 re-open 25:8 re-present 23:1 re-presented 22:8 re-presents 21:2 reach 14:5 16:7 17:20 reached 13:24 read 7:11 21:3 36:16 reading 12:20 ready 12:19 real 21:11 48:21 50:14 realtor 13:2 reapply 38:24 41:4 43:12 Reasonable 44:21

rebuttal 15:21

recall 22:2 received 5:9,24 15:22 receives 18:20 receiving 13:23 15:7 19:9 25:15 recently 17:16 receptacle 24:16 reciprocal 20:9 recommend 6:21 17:23 recommendation 14:11,22 16:15,24 17:22 19:13,20 20:14,17 22:4, 13,18 24:7,10,23 50:24 51:16 recommendations 17:24 26:7 recommended 51:16, 19 reconsideration 25:9 record 5:5 6:23 18:2 51:24 recovering 18:17 recovery 18:23 recuse 53:13 recused 53:18 refer 40:22 refund 15:9 registration 21:22 regulations 14:13 16:17 38:6 reinstate 43:20 related 17:11 31:9,10,13 52:17,18 rely 21:10 Remember 29:6 remiss 26:23 remove 9:6.10 renew 39:1 40:13 41:3,7 45:8.9 renewals 49:13 renewed 44:12

reply 15:22 report 12:20 15:15,17 16:12 29:15 52:1 reports 47:3 48:6 represented 24:19 reprimanded 39:16 request 32:18 requested 12:25 23:23 24:21 33:21,23 require 14:3 43:15 required 28:17 51:9 requirement 31:4 requires 38:24 reserve 50:3.4 reserved 21:13 residents 22:12 Resource 21:7 **Respondent** 12:24 13:3, 5,8,10,12,14,18,19,21, 23,25 14:5,7,15 15:6,7, 10,12,14,16,18,22,25 16:1,5,6,7,9,13,16 17:13, 15,18,20 18:15,17,19,22, 25 19:7,8,11 20:3,11 21:5,14,19,21 23:5,7,10, 11,12,13,16,22,23 24:1, 4,5,18,21 25:2 22:1 23:15 retainer 15:8.23 return 15:8 returned 23:17 revealed 21:19 50:8,9 reviewing 32:17

Respondent's 15:22 response 16:8 30:6 results 13:11 15:25 review 5:10,24 19:2 48:9 revoked 23:8 25:19 Richards 4:22.23 6:7 7:14,17 8:24 14:21 18:1, 4.5 Rick 4:22

rig 37:22 rises 23:3 Risk 30:6 road 37:22 **Roberts** 12:5,6,9,10,12 Robin 4:20 47:13 rollcall 4:10,14 20:21 Rousseau 4:24,25 5:14, 16 7:7,24 8:3 9:9,11,21, 23 10:13,20 12:11,14 14:23 19:21 20:16 22:17 31:25 32:4,7 34:8,18,19, 20,25 38:17 40:8 41:5 47:7,11,17,24 53:2 rule 38:20,22 rules 12:5,6,9,10,12 14:12 16:17 38:5.13 43:25 S satisfactory 31:8 schedule 42:2 scheduled 22:9

screen 16:5 script 7:11 8:22 search 13:14 Searches 21:7 seat 11:12 seconded 9:25 11:4 17:2 18:7 20:21 22:20 26:9.13 34:14 35:15 41:10 44:2 section 12:18 24:9 secured 21:11 securities 20:5 security 28:8 seeking 15:9 19:7 seizure 37:25 self-employed 31:17 self-sufficient 49:3 send 19:14 22:5 32:25 33:25 35:10

**sensitive** 15:6 44:9

separate 23:9 24:15

separated 17:17

separation 24:19

**September** 5:21 13:15 47:4 48:11,17

sergeant 32:1

serve 4:13 26:4

**service** 22:12 47:8,23 49:11 53:5,22

**services** 12:25 14:17 15:13 18:21 21:21 22:1 28:1

serving 47:21

settle 25:14

**Shanks** 4:12 5:3,4,12,16 8:1,4,5 9:15,17 11:16 16:25 26:8,12,14 33:2,6 47:15

sheet 29:11 30:1 31:16

**Sheriffs** 30:17 37:11,13

**short** 46:21

**shot** 16:5

**show** 5:5

showing 29:13

shows 31:23 52:19

sic 34:9

sign 19:2

signature 19:9

**sir** 30:22 34:24 36:12,18 39:14,23 41:12 42:3,18 45:8.24 46:12

sit 11:17 36:2

**skill** 32:8

skills 29:14

someone's 44:2

**sounds** 25:22

south 37:19.20

Southwest 52:25

speak 16:21

specifically 18:18 23:4

split 9:1

staff 4:3 41:6

standing 49:9

start 12:20 49:1

started 49:15 50:1

starting 49:2

starts 48:25 50:22

state 20:4,10 36:8 43:8

**stated** 13:5,7,10,12,14, 18,19,21,23,25 15:10,12, 14,16,22 16:1 17:15 23:21

statement 14:17

**states** 15:7,24 18:16,19, 22,25 21:10 29:8 32:1 39:19 51:13

**status** 13:9

**statute** 19:17 22:14

40:18

statutory 31:4

**stay** 48:4

**staying** 49:7,8

**step** 53:16

stop 44:19

stopped 33:14

stranger 10:6

**strap** 48:3

strictly 39:25

Stuart 4:14 6:4 17:7 25:10,13 26:3,24,25 27:6.7 47:13

student 52:20 53:5

study 31:10 52:18

styles 21:6

subject 15:14

submitted 19:5 31:11

subsequent 14:9 15:24

22:10

suggests 33:23

summary 21:3

Sumner 30:5

supersede 38:20

superseding 38:22

supplied 30:23

supports 14:15

supposed 28:9

**surety** 23:18,21,22,25 24:3,17,21

suspect 43:24

system 49:5

Т

tags 11:19

taking 4:12 48:14

talk 36:2,8,25 37:9 48:10

talked 49:25

talking 49:18

teasing 26:25

Tech 52:25

technical 53:21

technology 52:11

telephone 13:21 46:7

telling 32:16 42:8

ten 16:12

ten-minute 46:18

**Tennessee** 4:7 14:12 16:16 18:18,24 19:1,3, 10,16 20:8,12 21:15,21, 25 22:10,12 32:19 37:16, 17 39:7 40:1 42:6 43:7

50:23 52:9 53:1,4,21

term 47:13

terminated 23:15

test 11:20 41:23 43:13

testing 20:10

text 13:8 16:5

texts 15:9

**thing** 6:14 12:4 33:11 47:1 50:7,10

things 38:8 46:1

**Thomas** 12:19 15:4 17:6 18:12 21:1 22:25 25:7,22 26:2 27:4,14 31:3 36:14 38:21 40:24 44:23 52:12

time 4:13 5:10,24 8:9,11 20:4 25:23 29:21 33:13 34:21,22 35:2 44:12,21 45:16

timeframe 14:2 37:6

times 24:14 26:4 50:5

today 4:4 28:9 42:2

told 27:23 33:8,13

topic 48:9

totals 48:22

Town 51:18 53:6

training 29:2

**transcript** 50:23 51:12 52:20

transfer 43:7

trend 49:18

truck 37:22,24

turn 4:8 6:12 37:8

turned 27:6

typically 21:12 38:23

U

uh-huh 29:18

unanswered 14:6

unclaimed 18:18,24 19:4,7

undeliverable 24:17

understand 25:6 33:11 41:12 45:8

understanding 43:18

unfavorable 39:12

**United** 51:13

**University** 50:23 52:9, 23 53:4,21

unlicensed 19:17 20:2 22:7 23:4 24:10 25:23

unsigned 16:4

unusual 36:4 38:2,6 48:15

update 13:9 24:13

Updated 24:20

updates 14:3 16:10,11

V

vacant 24:15

Valentine 5:1,2 6:5,7
7:1,15,16 8:15,20,21,22
9:18,20 10:4,9 11:14,21,
23 12:3 14:20,24 15:2
16:19 17:1,4 18:6,10
19:18,22,24 20:15,20,24
22:16,20,23 25:16,21
26:1,9,17,20 27:11,15
29:16 30:7,11,16,20
31:23 34:2,14,16,19
35:2,5,14,18,21 38:12
39:21 41:8,10 43:5,16
44:17 45:2,5 46:17,19,22
51:8 52:2 53:14,20

vehicle 21:22

Vehicles 22:11

verbal 16:10

verifiable 31:7

Vest 4:8,9,16,18,20,22, 24 5:1,3,5 6:13,14,23 7:6,9,16,20,22 8:2,5,19, 25 9:6,9,13,16,22,25 10:2,10,16,19 11:2,4,7, 13,16,22 12:4,14,17 16:21 18:2,5 26:11,16,22 27:17 29:6,18,25 30:3,9, 14,22 31:15 32:13,23 33:5,7 34:10,15,17,23 35:4,8,17,23 36:12,15,21 37:9 40:10,21 41:11,16, 21,25 42:8,18,23 43:4 45:7,15,21,24 46:6,9,11, 16,25 47:12,19 48:1 51:3,10,23 52:4,21,23 53:4,15

Vice-chair 4:6 10:12,14, 17 11:9,10,25

VICE-CHAIRMAN 4:2, 17 5:7,15,19 6:3,6,10 7:3 9:4,8 11:11,15 12:13 17:23 20:18 26:6 39:24 40:3 42:14 43:10 51:21 53:12,17

viewing 29:4 51:1

violation 19:15 21:15 24:9

Virginia 20:8 21:20

vote 6:18 8:9,12,19 9:1, 19 10:2,11,20,23 12:8,10 14:25 17:2 22:21 34:12 35:19

W

wait 6:19,24 9:2

waiting 6:21

**Walt** 5:1 7:15 8:15,19,20, 21 9:5,18,20 10:3 11:18, 23 46:22 53:25

wanted 7:10 27:23

wanting 33:3 42:7 45:20

warning 14:12 16:16

watch 47:24 48:2 49:17

watching 49:19

website 21:6,10,23

week 26:24 42:2

weeks 37:25 42:3

west 19:1.10 20:8

wife 37:15 38:7 44:4,7

wife's 37:24

withdraw 9:11

**work** 23:23 32:8 38:4 44:15,20

worked 28:6 31:18 37:11 40:6 42:4 44:11 45:19

working 19:12 27:1 30:11 37:18 44:19

works 31:16

51:17

wrestle 8:24

writing 29:14

written 15:15,17 16:11, 12

Υ

year 6:16 31:8,12 48:20, 25 49:2 52:16

years 30:17,19 32:9,11 33:3 37:3,16,21 38:20 40:19 49:15,25 50:1 51:19